Whose Shade Counts?

Compare how place, role, and text type shape perspectives.

10.CL.6 "Compare and/or contrast the perspectives in a variety of fiction, nonfiction, informational, digital, and multimodal texts produced from diverse historical, cultural, and global viewpoints, not limited to the grade-level literary focus."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Number the three texts, underline one phrase in each that reveals whose needs matter most, and circle one detail in each that helps explain that perspective.

Three Views of Shade

(1) In a fictional scene set in Karachi, Pakistan, a street vendor narrates a hot afternoon. "By noon, the metal lid of my tea cart was too hot to touch. My father pointed to the old tree beside the market: 'People once waited there without paying for a cold drink.' Now the bus stop stood in full sun across the road. I imagined planting a row of trees near the stop, where workers could rest between buses. But our carts already crowded the curb. If planting took away space to sell, whose comfort would the trees protect?"

(2) An imagined municipal planning brief from Athens, Greece, addresses a similar problem in a different voice. It recommends fabric canopies over a busy pedestrian plaza, rather than new trees along its narrow sidewalks. Canopies would provide shade soon, while keeping a clear path for people using wheelchairs and for delivery carts. The brief acknowledges a cost: city workers would need to inspect the fabric and replace damaged panels. Its final line asks officials to measure success not by the number of structures installed, but by how many people can cross the plaza comfortably during the hottest hours.

(3) A fictional social media post by a bus rider in Lagos, Nigeria, opens with a blunt line: "Please stop calling a painted bus shelter shade." The rider describes a shelter whose roof does not cover the line of waiting passengers. A new canopy matters more to her than a distant promise of trees, because her bus comes every day, not years from now. Yet she also asks who will repair it after a storm. Other riders reply that a shaded stop should leave room for the queue, not force people into the street.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What need do the Karachi vendor and the Lagos rider share? Give one detail from each text.

2. How do the Karachi vendor and the Athens planners differ in their preferred way to provide shade? What concern helps explain each choice?

3. How does the form of the Karachi scene differ from the Athens brief, and how does each form shape the way its concern is presented?

4. The Athens planners and Lagos rider both discuss canopies. How do their priorities differ, and what detail in each text shows the difference?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write five sentences from the perspective of a maintenance worker, bus driver, or shop owner in one of the three settings. Propose a shade plan, then compare your new viewpoint with two texts using at least one specific detail from each.

ANSWER KEY

Whose Shade Counts?

GRADE 10 · 10.CL.6

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Number the three texts, underline one phrase in each that reveals whose needs matter most, and circle one detail in each that helps explain that perspective. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What need do the Karachi vendor and the Lagos rider share? Give one detail from each text.	**Both want shade where people wait for buses. The vendor imagines trees near the stop, while the rider says the shelter roof does not cover the line.**
2	How do the Karachi vendor and the Athens planners differ in their preferred way to provide shade? What concern helps explain each choice?	**The vendor imagines trees near the bus stop but worries about losing space for carts. The planners recommend canopies because they would provide shade soon without narrowing sidewalks.**
3	How does the form of the Karachi scene differ from the Athens brief, and how does each form shape the way its concern is presented?	**The scene uses a vendor's first-person experience and family memory to show how shade affects daily work. The brief uses a recommendation and a measure of success to focus on public access.**
4	The Athens planners and Lagos rider both discuss canopies. How do their priorities differ, and what detail in each text shows the difference?	**The planners focus on comfortable passage across a plaza and clear sidewalks. The rider focuses on covering the line at a bus stop she uses every day.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

As a maintenance worker in Lagos, I would build a wider canopy at the bus stop and set aside money for repairs. The rider is right that the current shelter leaves the line exposed, and a tree planted today would not shade tomorrow's commute. Still, I share the Athens planners' concern about keeping a clear route, since a canopy post in the queue could push riders into the street. I would place its supports behind the waiting area. Unlike the rider, I would make a repair schedule public before we call the project finished.

Accept different interpretations when students support them with accurate details from the texts. For Part 3, look for a distinct role, a workable plan, and comparisons with two texts.