Follow the Evidence

Evaluate sources before making a school decision.

10.RL.21 "Locate and determine the usefulness of relevant and credible information to answer a question, solve a problem, or defend a position."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two sources you would use to decide whether to install the station, and circle a limitation of each. Number the underlined sources 1 and 2 in order of usefulness.

A Station Near the Gym?

1. At Ridgeview High, the student council is investigating one question: Would a new bottle-filling station near the gym reduce disposable bottle waste enough to justify its cost? During five school days in October, custodian Mara Chen counted 240 disposable bottles in bins beside the gym and recorded her tally each day. Her dated log captures waste in one location, not every bottle used at school. A station could replace some of those bottles, but the count alone cannot show how many students would switch to reusable ones. The council needs evidence about demand, cost, and likely changes in behavior.

2. To investigate demand, council members examined a facilities log. Technician Luis Ortega timed the line at the school's existing filling station before three afternoon practices. He recorded waits of two to four minutes and noted that some athletes left without filling a bottle. His observations point to a possible access problem, although three afternoons may not reflect the entire season. In an online poll shared by one basketball team, 38 of 45 respondents said they would use a station near the gym. Because students chose whether to answer and only one team received the link, the poll cannot represent all gym users.

3. Cost and promises require separate checks. A dated district purchasing estimate lists $2,800 for the station and filter, but excludes installation labor and future filter replacements. A station vendor's brochure claims its product can "eliminate 80 percent of plastic bottle waste" without identifying the schools measured or explaining how that percentage was calculated. The brochure has a clear sales interest, so its number is weak support for a prediction at Ridgeview. The council could compare gym-bin counts before and after installation, but a change in counts would still need context, such as shifts in practice schedules or attendance.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Which source provides the strongest evidence that disposable bottles are being discarded near the gym? Explain why it is credible and name one limit.

2. What question can Ortega's log help answer? Why can't it prove that a new station would reduce bottle waste?

3. How useful is the basketball team's poll for predicting what all gym users would do? Use the way respondents were selected to explain.

4. Which source gives the council a starting point for estimating cost? What information is still needed before it can claim to know the full cost?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

The principal now asks whether a second station should go near the gym or the cafeteria. Write a short research plan naming two specific sources you would seek, who would create each, how each would help you compare locations, and one limitation you would check.

ANSWER KEY

Follow the Evidence

GRADE 10 · 10.RL.21

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two sources you would use to decide whether to install the station, and circle a limitation of each. Number the underlined sources 1 and 2 in order of usefulness. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which source provides the strongest evidence that disposable bottles are being discarded near the gym? Explain why it is credible and name one limit.	**Chen's dated, daily tally directly counts bottles in gym-area bins. It covers only five school days and one location.**
2	What question can Ortega's log help answer? Why can't it prove that a new station would reduce bottle waste?	**It helps answer whether students face waits at the existing station before practices. It does not measure whether students would use a new station instead of disposable bottles.**
3	How useful is the basketball team's poll for predicting what all gym users would do? Use the way respondents were selected to explain.	**It suggests interest among respondents, but only one team received the link and answering was voluntary. It cannot predict the behavior of all gym users.**
4	Which source gives the council a starting point for estimating cost? What information is still needed before it can claim to know the full cost?	**The dated district purchasing estimate gives a $2,800 price for the station and filter. The council still needs installation labor and future filter replacement costs.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would request daily bottle counts from custodians for both the gym and cafeteria bins over four weeks, using the same counting rules at each site. I would also ask facilities staff to record line lengths and wait times at nearby fountains during comparable busy periods. These records could show where waste and access problems are greatest. I would check whether events or different numbers of students at each site make the locations unfair to compare.

Accept other relevant sources when students explain how their methods and scope affect usefulness. For the research plan, look for two identifiable source creators, a clear use for each source, and a plausible limitation.