Two Sources, One Case

Build a position with research and public information

10.RL.26 "Compose clear, coherent writing that incorporates information from at least one scholarly and at least one non-scholarly source and demonstrates a clear position on a topic, answers a research question, or presents a solution to a problem."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's position, circle the names of the two sources, and number one detail from each source that supports the position.

A Later First Bell

1 At 7:20 a.m., the first bell rings while some students are still fighting sleep. Our district should move the high school start time to 8:45 a.m. next fall, even if bus routes need to change. This proposal is not based on the idea that every teenager stays up late by choice. It rests on two kinds of information: a published study that measures what happened when a school changed its schedule, and a public health webpage that recommends a workable starting point. Together, those sources make a stronger case than either a tired student's story or a general rule could make alone.

2 In a 2018 study published in *Science Advances*, Gideon Dunster and his colleagues tracked Seattle high school students before and after a later start time. When the start moved from 7:50 to 8:45, median school-night sleep duration rose by 34 minutes. Students' grades also improved, although the schedule change alone cannot prove what caused every improvement. The study gives our proposal a concrete result, not a guarantee. A different source, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention's public webpage "Schools Start Too Early," reports that the American Academy of Pediatrics recommends an 8:30 a.m. or later start for middle and high schools.

3 The two sources do different jobs. The study shows that students in one setting gained sleep after a schedule change; the public webpage offers a broader recommendation that families can understand without reading a research article. An 8:45 start meets that recommendation and matches the later time examined in Seattle. Still, a district should not promise that every student will gain exactly 34 minutes. Bus routes and after-school activities must be planned with families. We should publish a draft bus schedule this spring, invite comments, and set an 8:45 start for next fall.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does one detail from the scholarly study support the writer's position?

2. What does the public webpage add to the argument that the study does not?

3. Why does the writer say the district should not promise every student exactly 34 more minutes of sleep?

4. Write one sentence connecting a detail from each source to the proposed 8:45 start.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Another high school can try an 8:45 start for one semester but has not decided whether to keep it. Write one paragraph recommending how the school should test the schedule; use a specific finding from Dunster's scholarly study and a recommendation from the CDC public webpage, and explain how both support your plan.

ANSWER KEY

Two Sources, One Case

GRADE 10 · 10.RL.26

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's position, circle the names of the two sources, and number one detail from each source that supports the position. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does one detail from the scholarly study support the writer's position?	**After Seattle's start time moved to 8:45, median school-night sleep duration rose by 34 minutes. That result supports trying an 8:45 start in the writer's district.**
2	What does the public webpage add to the argument that the study does not?	**It reports a recommendation that middle and high schools start at 8:30 a.m. or later, giving the district a broader guideline.**
3	Why does the writer say the district should not promise every student exactly 34 more minutes of sleep?	**The study reports a change in median sleep duration among Seattle students, not a guaranteed result for each student in another district.**
4	Write one sentence connecting a detail from each source to the proposed 8:45 start.	**An 8:45 start matches the time studied in Seattle and meets the 8:30-or-later recommendation reported on the CDC webpage.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school should try the 8:45 start for one semester and measure students' sleep before and during the trial. In Dunster's scholarly study, median school-night sleep duration rose by 34 minutes after Seattle schools moved their start time to 8:45. That finding gives the school a reason to check for a similar change, not to assume one will occur. The CDC public webpage reports a recommendation to start middle and high schools at 8:30 or later, so the trial would also meet that guideline. The school should review its results before making the change permanent.

Accept accurate paraphrases that distinguish the Seattle study's measured result from the recommendation reported on the public webpage. In Part 3, look for a clear trial plan and an explanation of how each source supports it.