After Five

Weigh written sources before a library vote

11.RL.24.a "Assess the usefulness of written information to answer a research question, solve a problem, or take a position."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline evidence that could help answer the board's question. Circle a limitation of each document, and number the documents from most to least useful for deciding whether to extend Sunday hours.

Should the Library Stay Open?

1. In the fictional town of Harbor Glen, the public library closes at 5 p.m. on Sundays. The library board asks: Should it stay open until 7 p.m.? A March operations report, signed by circulation manager Elena Ruiz, records door-counter totals for four Sundays in February: 112, 95, 104, and 101 visits between 4 and 5 p.m. The report also records 300 online catalog searches between 5 and 7 p.m. across those Sundays. It does not say how many searches came from different people, or whether searchers wanted to enter the building. Ruiz says the counter was checked against manual tallies twice.

2. A student group posts an open letter titled "Keep the Doors Open." It says, "Hundreds of residents are locked out every Sunday evening," citing the 300 catalog searches in Ruiz's report. The letter does not mention that one person can make several searches, or that the report counts searches rather than people. It includes six short comments from students who say they need a quiet place to study after 5 p.m. The writers invite residents to sign a petition for longer hours. Their experiences point to a possible need, but the letter does not establish how many residents share it.

3. A separate budget memo, signed by library finance officer Malik Chen, estimates that two extra hours on Sunday would cost $180 per week in wages and utilities. Chen lists the hourly staffing rate and the past year's average utility cost as the basis for the estimate, but notes that utility costs vary by season. The memo does not predict how many people would use the added hours. The board must decide whether the likely benefit justifies the cost. It will vote in six weeks and can request new evidence before adopting a permanent schedule.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How useful is Ruiz's report for estimating demand after 5 p.m.? Give one strength and one limit.

2. Does the open letter's claim about "hundreds of residents" accurately use Ruiz's report? Explain how the letter's purpose affects its usefulness.

3. For estimating the cost of longer hours, why is Chen's memo useful, and what keeps its estimate from being certain?

4. Based on at least two documents, what could the board reasonably conclude now, and what can it not yet conclude?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Propose a new written record the board could collect before voting. In 3 to 4 sentences, name who would create it, what it would measure, how it would address a gap in the current sources, and one remaining limitation.

After Five

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline evidence that could help answer the board's question. Circle a limitation of each document, and number the documents from most to least useful for deciding whether to extend Sunday hours. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How useful is Ruiz's report for estimating demand after 5 p.m.? Give one strength and one limit.	**Its checked door counts show visits just before closing, but catalog searches after closing do not show how many people wanted to enter.**
2	Does the open letter's claim about "hundreds of residents" accurately use Ruiz's report? Explain how the letter's purpose affects its usefulness.	**No. The report counts 300 searches, not hundreds of distinct residents. Because the letter seeks petition signatures, its claim needs checking, though the student comments may reveal a real need.**
3	For estimating the cost of longer hours, why is Chen's memo useful, and what keeps its estimate from being certain?	**A library finance officer gives a $180 weekly estimate based on staffing rates and past utility costs. Utility costs vary by season.**
4	Based on at least two documents, what could the board reasonably conclude now, and what can it not yet conclude?	**The student comments suggest some demand, and Chen estimates a weekly cost of $180. The board cannot yet conclude how many people would visit after 5 p.m. or whether that use would justify the cost.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Library staff could run a four-week trial of 5 to 7 p.m. Sunday hours and publish dated counts of visitors and their reasons for coming. Those counts would test whether catalog searches reflect demand for access to the building and would let the board compare use with Chen's cost estimate. A short trial might miss seasonal changes in demand.

Accept different source rankings or provisional conclusions when students distinguish what each document establishes from what it cannot show. For the new record, look for a feasible measure, a clear link to an evidence gap, and a realistic limitation.