# Hear the Evidence

Evaluate claims, evidence, and delivery at a school board hearing.

**12.CL.10** "Determine through active listening the purpose, credibility, and effectiveness of a speaker or multiple sources of information by evaluating tone, organization, content…"

NAME _____ DATE _____

## 1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

**YOUR JOB** Underline each speaker's main claim, circle limits or missing evidence, and number two vocal or physical cues that affect how you judge the speakers.

### A Later Start?

(1) At a school board hearing about a proposed 8:45 a.m. start, senior Maya Chen steps to the microphone with a printed survey. She wants the board to run a one-semester trial instead of changing the schedule permanently. Speaking slowly, she explains that 312 of 480 students who answered a voluntary school survey said they sleep less than eight hours on school nights. She adds that the survey did not ask what time students fell asleep. Maya pauses, looks at the board members, and asks them to measure attendance and first-period tardiness during any trial. Several board members take notes.

(2) Next, bus driver Luis Ortega opposes the trial. He begins with a practical concern: later dismissal could overlap with elementary bus routes. He holds up a route sheet but does not give times or explain whether drivers could change assignments. His voice sharpens as he says, "Two drivers told me this plan will wreck every route, so the entire transportation staff rejects it." He points toward Maya and adds, "If you care about younger children, you must vote no." After the room grows quiet, he says the district should publish an actual route schedule before any vote.

(3) During questions, board member Priya Shah asks Maya whether her survey proves a later start would increase sleep. Maya shakes her head and says it cannot: students chose whether to respond, and the survey measured reported sleep, not the effects of a schedule change. She proposes collecting the same measures before and during a trial, while checking bus conflicts with published route times. Luis nods at that suggestion but repeats that his two conversations show "every driver" opposes the plan. The board chair closes by requesting route times and a plan for comparing attendance before and during the trial.

## 2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does Maya's order of ideas support her purpose? Cite two steps in her presentation.

2. Which two details limit how confidently the board can use Maya's survey to predict the effect of a later start?

3. Identify two flaws in Luis's argument. Use his claims to explain each flaw.

4. How do Luis's vocal or physical cues and his final request affect the effectiveness of his message? Explain both.

## 3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A third speaker says, "All families prefer the trial because three parents told me so," while crossing their arms. Write a 70 to 100 word note to the board assessing the claim and the cue, proposing a way to gather stronger evidence, and asking one question that would test whether the trial is feasible.

ANSWER KEY

# Hear the Evidence

GRADE 12 · 12.CL.10

## PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each speaker's main claim, circle limits or missing evidence, and number two vocal or physical cues that affect how you judge the speakers. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

## PART 2 · ANSWERS

| # | QUESTION | ANSWER |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | How does Maya's order of ideas support her purpose? Cite two steps in her presentation. | **Maya proposes a temporary trial, presents survey results, acknowledges a limit of the survey, and asks the board to measure outcomes. This order supports a trial rather than an unsupported permanent change.** |
| 2 | Which two details limit how confidently the board can use Maya's survey to predict the effect of a later start? | **Students chose whether to answer, so respondents may not represent all students. The survey measured reported sleep under the current schedule, not what would happen after a later start.** |
| 3 | Identify two flaws in Luis's argument. Use his claims to explain each flaw. | **Luis generalizes from two drivers to the entire transportation staff. His claim that caring about younger children requires a no vote presents a false choice.** |
| 4 | How do Luis's vocal or physical cues and his final request affect the effectiveness of his message? Explain both. | **His sharpened voice and pointing may make his concern seem urgent but could distract from his weak evidence. Requesting a published route schedule gives the board a concrete way to test his concern.** |

## PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Three parent conversations cannot establish what all families prefer, especially if those parents already support the trial. The speaker's crossed arms might suggest discomfort, but posture alone does not establish honesty or intent. I would ask the district to survey a representative sample of families, including those who depend on buses, and report response rates alongside the results. I would also ask, "Which childcare arrangements would need to change under an 8:45 a.m. start?" That question tests whether the recommendation accounts for costs outside the school day.

Accept other supported interpretations of the cues, provided students do not treat body language as proof of intent. For the open task, look for a check that goes beyond three parent conversations and a question about practical effects of the trial.