Light With Purpose

Trace how an argument balances evidence, tone, and implications.

12.CL.11.c "Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence, making intentional rhetorical choices to convey a specific tone or style..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim and two supporting details, circle two transitions, and label the objection in the final paragraph 1 and its larger implication 2.

A Better Way to Light the Path

1 At Harbor High, the east entrance stays bright long after evening rehearsals end. Last Thursday, our student council walked from the auditorium to the bus stop at 8:15 p.m. We could see the path clearly, yet a floodlight also threw a sharp beam into the windows of the apartment building across the street. Some residents want the light switched off; students leaving late need a safe route. The school should instead aim the fixture down toward the path and put it on a timer that runs through the last scheduled departure. This solution respects both needs without treating them as equal at every hour.

2 Consider what the walk actually showed. The bright strip on the sidewalk helped us spot a curb and another person approaching, while the beam above our heads did nothing to improve either view. A downward-facing shield could keep light on the walking surface while blocking much of the spill toward nearby windows. Moreover, the rehearsal calendar gives staff a practical way to set the timer: the building was scheduled to close at 8:30 that night, so an automatic shutoff at 9:00 would leave a half-hour buffer. This is a proposal, not proof that every late departure occurs on schedule.

3 Of course, a timer alone cannot cover an unexpected late bus or a weekend event. Therefore, the school should allow the custodian to extend the light's operating time and post a phone number for reporting a dark path. That safeguard answers the strongest objection without making permanent glare the default. The council's single walk cannot establish what happens every night, so the school should check the route with students and neighbors after a trial month. If the path remains visible and the windows receive less stray light, a small change in one fixture could model a larger habit: design public spaces with the people beside them in mind.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What change does the writer argue for, and how does the claim account for both students and neighbors?

2. How does the council's observation about the sidewalk and the beam support shielding the fixture rather than switching it off?

3. What shift does “Moreover” signal in paragraph 2, and how does the writer's final sentence in that paragraph affect the tone?

4. How does the proposed trial strengthen the conclusion's larger implication?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Harbor High plans to replace printed rehearsal schedules with an online-only calendar. Write one paragraph of 85 to 115 words arguing for or against that change, using two specific, plausible examples, a counterargument, at least two transitions, a measured tone, and a conclusion that shows a broader implication.

ANSWER KEY

Light With Purpose

GRADE 12 · 12.CL.11.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim and two supporting details, circle two transitions, and label the objection in the final paragraph 1 and its larger implication 2. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What change does the writer argue for, and how does the claim account for both students and neighbors?	**The writer proposes aiming the light down and timing it to cover scheduled departures. This keeps the student route lit while reducing light directed toward neighbors' windows.**
2	How does the council's observation about the sidewalk and the beam support shielding the fixture rather than switching it off?	**Light on the sidewalk helped the council see a curb and another person, but the beam above them did not help. Shielding could preserve useful path lighting while reducing spill.**
3	What shift does “Moreover” signal in paragraph 2, and how does the writer's final sentence in that paragraph affect the tone?	**“Moreover” shifts from evidence about where light is useful to evidence that a timer is practical. The final sentence acknowledges uncertainty, giving the proposal a measured tone.**
4	How does the proposed trial strengthen the conclusion's larger implication?	**Checking the route with students and neighbors would test whether both needs are met. That supports the broader idea that public spaces should be designed with nearby people in mind.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school should keep one printed rehearsal schedule beside its online calendar rather than move entirely online. For instance, if a student's phone battery dies before practice, the student could still check the noticeboard. Similarly, a family member arriving for pickup could confirm the end time without opening a website. Admittedly, printing a fresh sheet after each change takes staff time. However, posting one updated page at the auditorium door would take less effort than distributing copies to every student, and a printed update date could prevent confusion. When a school shares essential information in more than one form, convenience need not come at the expense of access.

Accept other defensible claims if the examples support them, the counterargument receives a reasoned response, and the conclusion extends beyond the schedule decision. The sample's situations are hypothetical, not claims about events that occurred.