The Shade Case

Trace how a public argument builds its case

12.CL.11 "Compose, edit, and revise both short and extended products in which the development, organization, and style are relevant and suitable to task, purpose, and audience, using an appropriate command of language. a..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim and two reasons for it, circle the source-based evidence, and number two transitions that guide you through the argument. Use your marks to examine how the writer builds a case for a specific audience.

A Place to Wait

1 At three o'clock, a student waiting outside the high school shifts from one foot to the other because the concrete bench is hot. This small scene raises a larger question: who gets protection from heat while waiting for a public bus? Our transit agency should prioritize shade at stops near schools, especially those where riders wait in direct sun. Students cannot choose when the final bell rings, and many must wait at the same time. Shade would make that ordinary trip more comfortable without requiring riders to buy anything. It would also signal that young riders belong in decisions about public space.

2 First, the case for shade rests on more than discomfort. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency reports in its guide *Using Trees and Vegetation to Reduce Heat Islands* that shaded surfaces may be 20 to 45 degrees Fahrenheit cooler than the peak temperatures of unshaded materials. That comparison concerns surfaces, not the air temperature at every bus stop, so it should not be treated as a promise of a specific health outcome. Still, it explains why a shaded bench or waiting area can matter on a sunny afternoon. To decide where to act first, the agency could observe which stops lack shade and record how long riders wait there.

3 Of course, shelters cost money, and planting a tree is not a quick fix. Rather than promise a roof at every stop, the agency could begin with a few exposed locations and select designs that leave clear space for people using wheelchairs. It could then ask riders whether the new shade changes where they wait and compare those observations with costs before expanding the project. A sunny bus stop may look like a minor inconvenience from a passing car. For someone who waits there each school day, however, it is a test of whose time and comfort public planning takes seriously.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What action does the writer want the transit agency to take, and why does the writer focus on stops near schools?

2. How does the EPA finding support the argument, and what limit does the writer place on that evidence?

3. Why might the writer begin with a student and a hot bench instead of beginning with the EPA finding?

4. What objection does “Of course” introduce, and how does the writer respond without dismissing it?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write an 85 to 105 word argument to your principal supporting or opposing an optional quiet study room during lunch. Include a brief imagined student moment, a practical reason, a fair objection and response, two transitions, and a conclusion that shows why the choice matters; do not invent statistics.

ANSWER KEY

The Shade Case

GRADE 12 · 12.CL.11

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim and two reasons for it, circle the source-based evidence, and number two transitions that guide you through the argument. Use your marks to examine how the writer builds a case for a specific audience. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What action does the writer want the transit agency to take, and why does the writer focus on stops near schools?	**The writer wants the agency to prioritize shade at stops near schools. Students leave at the same time and may have to wait in direct sun.**
2	How does the EPA finding support the argument, and what limit does the writer place on that evidence?	**The finding shows that shaded surfaces can be much cooler than unshaded ones. It measures surfaces, not the air at each stop, and does not promise a particular health outcome.**
3	Why might the writer begin with a student and a hot bench instead of beginning with the EPA finding?	**The brief scene makes the problem concrete for readers before the writer presents evidence and a proposal.**
4	What objection does "Of course" introduce, and how does the writer respond without dismissing it?	**Shelters cost money, and trees take time to grow. The writer proposes starting at a few exposed stops, checking accessibility, and comparing rider observations with costs before expanding.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Imagine finishing lunch with a test ahead and nowhere calm to review your notes. Principal, please pilot a quiet study room during lunch. Students who need to read or revise could use the space without asking classmates to lower their voices in the cafeteria. To keep supervision practical, open the room only when a staff member is available and limit seats to its safe capacity. Some may argue that lunch should remain social. However, the room would be optional, not a replacement for the cafeteria. A modest pilot would show whether our school can offer students a meaningful choice in how they use their break.

Accept different defensible claims and reasons when students explain their choices using details from the passage. For the writing task, check that the objection receives a genuine response and that the conclusion extends beyond the immediate proposal.