Shade Source Check

Weigh evidence before recommending a public decision

12.RL.24 "Evaluate the credibility of sources in terms of authority, relevance, accuracy, and purpose. a. Assess the usefulness of written information to answer a research question, solve a problem, or take a position."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline details about how each source gathered information, and circle details that limit its usefulness or reveal its purpose. Number the three sources from 1, most useful, to 3, least useful, for choosing which stops should receive shade first.

Which Stops Need Shade?

1. The fictional city of Alder is deciding which three bus stops near its high school should receive shade first. A transportation office memo, signed by the city's stop-maintenance supervisor, reports observations at eleven nearby stops on one clear July afternoon. It names the three stops where waiting areas stayed unshaded longest between noon and 2 p.m. The memo includes observation times and stop locations but no passenger counts. Its observations help locate a summer problem, though one afternoon cannot show typical conditions.

2. A student council survey asked 38 students who boarded buses after school at the stop outside the gym whether shade would improve their wait. Thirty-one said yes. Recruiters collected responses on two hot afternoons and recorded the stop where each student boarded. Their report publishes the question asked and all response totals. It does not include students using other nearby stops, riders who travel in the morning, or adults. The survey shows a preference among respondents, not the whole community's view.

3. A shade-canopy company's brochure claims its canopy lowered bench surface temperatures by ten degrees at three test sites. It lists neither the sites nor the dates or methods used to take temperatures. The company offers a discount if Alder orders three canopies this month. Its brochure may help officials compare product features, but it cannot establish which stops have the greatest need or whether the temperature claim applies to Alder. The offer also gives the company a reason to emphasize benefits.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why is the transportation memo useful for choosing stops, and what limits its accuracy for that decision?

2. How does the student survey's sample limit the conclusions Alder can draw from its results?

3. How do the brochure's purpose and missing details affect the credibility of its temperature claim?

4. What information is missing from the memo that could help Alder decide which three stops to shade first? Explain why it matters.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Alder now asks whether to add an evening bus trip near the high school. In three sentences, evaluate the usefulness of one passage source using two credibility criteria, then name a better source and the information it should provide.

ANSWER KEY

Shade Source Check

GRADE 12 · 12.RL.24

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline details about how each source gathered information, and circle details that limit its usefulness or reveal its purpose. Number the three sources from 1, most useful, to 3, least useful, for choosing which stops should receive shade first. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why is the transportation memo useful for choosing stops, and what limits its accuracy for that decision?	**It identifies stops with the longest unshaded waits, but its observations come from only one clear July afternoon.**
2	How does the student survey's sample limit the conclusions Alder can draw from its results?	**It includes only students boarding at one stop on two hot afternoons, so it cannot represent riders at other stops or times.**
3	How do the brochure's purpose and missing details affect the credibility of its temperature claim?	**The company wants to sell canopies, and it gives no test sites, dates, or methods for checking the claim.**
4	What information is missing from the memo that could help Alder decide which three stops to shade first? Explain why it matters.	**Passenger counts by stop would show how many riders could benefit at each location.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The student council survey has limited relevance because it asks about shade, not evening travel. Its sample also limits its accuracy for this decision because recruiters questioned students on two hot afternoons, not evening riders. A transit agency report with hourly boarding counts and requests for later trips would better show evening demand.

Accept supported differences in source rankings if students explain how each source helps answer the shade-priority question. For Your Turn, accept any passage source evaluated against two credibility criteria and a plausible better source with specific information about evening demand.