# One Garden, Three Views

Compare how writers make their cases about a school rain garden.

**5.LF.26** "Analyze how two or more texts address similar topics in diverse media and formats, including graphics, live and/or recorded performances, and written works. a..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

## 1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

**YOUR JOB** Underline each writer's main point and circle one detail that supports it. Use your marks to compare what the writers want readers to notice.

### Should Cedar School Plant a Rain Garden?

1. **Maya, Green Team column:** After rain, water runs off Cedar School's roof and across the blacktop. A rain garden near the drain could catch some of that water. Its soil would let water soak in slowly, and its plants could give bees a place to visit. The Green Team found a puddle that stayed on the blacktop until the next morning. Let's turn that soggy spot into something useful.

2. **Eli, School News column:** A rain garden may help with puddles, but it will need care. The school custodian says leaves can block its inlet, so someone would have to clear them. The garden would also take up part of the space now used for jump rope. Eli asks the school to choose a spot carefully and make a care plan before anyone begins digging.

3. **Rosa, Class Journal column:** When our class visited a rain garden at the library, we spotted a bee on a flower and watched rainwater collect among the plants. I want a garden at Cedar School where classes can observe changes after storms. My teacher says we could record which plants bloom in each season. We filled a page with questions before the bell rang.

## 2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How do Maya's and Eli's recommendations about a rain garden differ?

2. Which detail does Eli give to show why a rain garden needs care? Explain how it supports his point.

3. Maya and Rosa both mention bees. What different reasons for planting a garden do their columns emphasize?

4. Compare the tones of Maya's last sentence and Eli's last sentence. Which words help create each tone?

## 3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a four-sentence newsletter recommendation for a Cedar School rain garden. Use one detail from each of two different writers, and explain how your plan adds to or differs from one writer's approach.

**ANSWER KEY**

# One Garden, Three Views

**GRADE 5 · 5.LF.26**

## PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each writer's main point and circle one detail that supports it. Use your marks to compare what the writers want readers to notice. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

## PART 2 · ANSWERS

| # | QUESTION | ANSWER |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | How do Maya's and Eli's recommendations about a rain garden differ? | **Maya wants to turn the soggy spot into a rain garden. Eli wants the school to choose a spot carefully and make a care plan before digging.** |
| 2 | Which detail does Eli give to show why a rain garden needs care? Explain how it supports his point. | **Eli says leaves can block the garden's inlet. Someone would need to clear them to keep the inlet open.** |
| 3 | Maya and Rosa both mention bees. What different reasons for planting a garden do their columns emphasize? | **Maya emphasizes catching runoff from the blacktop and giving bees a place to visit. Rosa emphasizes giving classes a place to observe nature after storms and across seasons.** |
| 4 | Compare the tones of Maya's last sentence and Eli's last sentence. Which words help create each tone? | **Maya sounds hopeful when she says to turn a 'soggy spot into something useful.' Eli sounds cautious when he asks the school to 'choose a spot carefully' and make a care plan.** |

## PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend a small rain garden beside the blacktop that leaves the jump-rope space open. Maya reports that a puddle stayed until the next morning, so catching some runoff could help. Eli warns that leaves can block the inlet, so a class could check it each week with an adult. My plan builds on Maya's idea by adding Eli's advice about caring for the garden.

Accept accurate comparisons supported by details from the named columns. For the newsletter recommendation, look for four original sentences, details from two different writers, and a clear explanation of how the student's plan adds to or differs from one approach.