LESSON MAKER PRO

Test the Claim

Use different experiences to weigh an argument.

GRADE 8 · 8.CL.9

8.CL.9 "Participate in collaborative discussions about arguments by evaluating claims, findings, reasoning, relevance, and evidence from multiple sources."

NAME _____ DATE _____

OUR GROUND RULES Read together first

1. Say whose experience an example comes from, even if it is yours.
2. Explain what an example shows and what it cannot show.
3. Question ideas, not people.
4. You may agree, disagree, or keep your view when the evidence supports it.

HOW TO PLAY Teams of 3 or 4

1. Choose one TOPIC card for your group.
2. Give each player a different ROLE card. With three players, the Claim Tracker also does the View Keeper's job.
3. Shuffle two printed sets of MOVE cards. Deal four to each player and set any extras aside.
4. Discuss the topic for eight minutes. Play a card to the middle only when you genuinely use its starter.
5. Stop when time is up, even if cards remain. Have the View Keeper sum up any agreement, open questions, and views that stayed the same. Then check your reflection statements.

AFTER THE ROUND Check what you did

- [ ] I compared examples from more than one person's experience.
- [ ] I checked how well an example supported a claim.
- [ ] I tested whether a reason connected to a claim.
- [ ] I checked whether a detail mattered to our question.

Cut along the dashed lines

TOPIC CARDS · pick one per round

TOPIC

Group Project Grades

Should every student in a group project get the same grade? Test claims using examples from different projects or students.

TOPIC

Lunch Seats

Should students choose their own lunch seats? Test claims using examples from different students' experiences.

TOPIC

Homework Options

Should students sometimes choose how to show what they learned in homework? Test claims using examples from different classes or students.

ROLE CARDS · one per player

ROLE

Claim Tracker

Listen for the main claim and ask when the group needs to make it clearer.

ROLE

Evidence Detective

Notice whose experience each example comes from and how much that example shows.

ROLE

Logic Linker

Check whether reasons support the claim and details matter to the question.

ROLE

View Keeper

Track what the group agrees on, what remains open, and which views stay the same.

MOVE CARDS · deal 4 to each player

MOVE CARD

NAME CLAIM

"The claim I hear is ____."

MOVE CARD

ADD EXAMPLE

"In my experience, a different example is ____."

MOVE CARD

COMPARE EXAMPLES

"Those two examples differ because ____."

MOVE CARD

TEST SUPPORT

"That example supports the claim because ____."

MOVE CARD

SPOT LIMIT

"That example has a limit because ____."

MOVE CARD

CHECK REASON

"That reason leads to the claim because ____."

MOVE CARD

CHECK RELEVANCE

"That detail matters to our question because ____."

MOVE CARD

SUM VIEWS

"Our views now are ____."

Cards last longer on thick paper.

Test the Claim

RUNNING THE ROUNDS

Run an eight-minute round for each topic used, rotating roles and reshuffling both sets of move cards between rounds. If participation is uneven, invite a quieter player to test a claim or example, but do not require a card play, disagreement, compromise, or change of opinion.

WHAT A STRONG ROUND SOUNDS LIKE

Maya	The claim I hear is that everyone should get the same grade because, in my science group, we each did a part.
Jules	In my experience, a different example is my history project, where one student did not help but got the same grade.
Noah	Those two examples differ because Maya's group shared the work, but Jules's group did not.
Ari	That example has a limit because one project cannot show how often group members do unequal work.
Maya	Our views now are that we agree equal grades can make sense when work is shared, but we have not agreed on a rule for every project.

LISTEN FOR

- A clear claim tied to the topic question
- Examples identified as coming from different people's experiences
- A specific explanation of what evidence supports or cannot show
- Reasons and details tested for their connection to the claim

There are no right answers to the topic cards. Score the moves students make, not their opinions.