Whose View Wins?

Read across media to test claims, evidence, and missing perspectives.

SS24.CWI.2c "Critique viewpoints presented in cable news commentary, editorials, political cartoons, and social media algorithms."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one claim supporting the bus plan and one opposing it, circle the examples used to support those claims, and number two places where missing information limits a viewpoint.

The Bus Plan Debate

1. In the fictional city of Riverton, council members are considering free bus rides for teenagers after 6 p.m., paid for by a higher downtown parking fee. On a cable news panel, one commentator calls the plan "a lifeline for students with late practices and jobs." She interviews a student who sometimes waits for a ride home. Another panelist calls the parking fee "a penalty on workers" and interviews a downtown cook who drives to work. Each story highlights a concern in the imagined debate, but neither guest shows how many people would benefit or pay more.

2. A local editorial urges the council to approve the plan. It argues that free rides could help teenagers reach work and school events, then asks readers to picture a bus stop at night. Its strongest claim is about access, but it gives no estimate of the program's cost. A critic describes a political cartoon opposing the plan: a giant parking meter holds a tiny bus on a string, while a driver reaches into an empty pocket. The image suggests drivers will pay while buses gain little. It does not show whether the proposed fee would actually strain most drivers.

3. Now imagine a teenager watches the panel clip and likes a post against the parking fee. A social media feed might show that teenager more posts opposing the plan, depending on how its ranking system uses past activity. Another teenager might see more posts praising free rides. The feed's choices can make a viewpoint seem more common than it is, even if no post is false. Before taking a side, readers can ask whose experience is missing, what numbers would test each claim, and whether the feed is offering a fair range of views.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How do the two cable panelists use individual stories to support opposing views, and what can those stories not establish?

2. What part of the editorial's case for the plan is hard to judge without more information? Explain why.

3. What viewpoint does the described political cartoon convey, and what information would help you test it?

4. How could two teenagers form different impressions of public opinion about the plan, even if the posts they see are not false?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a four-sentence caption for a new social media post about Riverton's plan. State your viewpoint, support it with one detail from the passage, identify evidence you still need, and explain how a feed favoring your post could shape readers' impressions.

ANSWER KEY

Whose View Wins?

HIGH SCHOOL · SS24.CWI.2c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one claim supporting the bus plan and one opposing it, circle the examples used to support those claims, and number two places where missing information limits a viewpoint. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How do the two cable panelists use individual stories to support opposing views, and what can those stories not establish?	**One cites a student who waits for a ride, while the other cites a cook who drives to work. Neither story establishes how many people would benefit or pay more.**
2	What part of the editorial's case for the plan is hard to judge without more information? Explain why.	**Whether the access benefits justify the program's cost is hard to judge because the editorial gives no cost estimate.**
3	What viewpoint does the described political cartoon convey, and what information would help you test it?	**It suggests drivers will pay while buses gain little. Evidence about whether the fee would strain most drivers would help test that view.**
4	How could two teenagers form different impressions of public opinion about the plan, even if the posts they see are not false?	**Their feeds might show different mixes of posts based on past activity. Repeated exposure to one side could make that viewpoint seem more common than it is.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I oppose Riverton's plan because a downtown cook drives to work and could face the higher parking fee. The cook's experience shows one possible cost to workers, not how common it is. We need an estimate of how many workers would pay more before calling the plan unfair. If a feed mostly shows posts like mine, readers could mistake this concern for everyone's view.

Accept either position on the plan when students distinguish an example from broader evidence. For the caption, check for four sentences and all four requested elements.