

Evidence Takes Shape

Trace how an investigation moves from a question to a supported claim.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RH.9-10.5 "Analyze how a text uses structure to emphasize key points or advance an explanation or analysis."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline words or phrases that signal a shift in the investigation, and number 1, 2, and 3 beside the sentences that introduce the problem, add evidence, and state the larger conclusion.

John Snow and the Broad Street Pump

- ① During London's 1854 cholera outbreak, physician John Snow noticed that deaths clustered near the Broad Street water pump. At the time, many people believed cholera traveled through foul air, so Snow's idea challenged a common explanation. He began by mapping where people had died and comparing those locations with local water sources. This opening problem matters because a cluster on a map could suggest a connection, but it could not yet show that the pump's water carried disease. Snow needed evidence that separated his explanation from other possible causes.
- ② To test the pattern, Snow looked for nearby groups who did not drink from the pump. A brewery beside Broad Street had few cholera deaths, and its workers usually drank beer rather than pump water. The local workhouse also had relatively few deaths; it used its own well. These comparisons form the middle of the account: instead of repeating the map's pattern, they narrow the possible cause. Snow also learned that a woman living far away in Hampstead had Broad Street water delivered to her home and later died of cholera. Her case extends the evidence beyond the neighborhood.
- ③ After gathering these examples, Snow presented his findings to local officials. The handle of the Broad Street pump was removed on September 8, 1854. The outbreak was already declining, so this action alone did not prove that removing the handle ended it. Instead, the final section clarifies the account's larger point: Snow used linked observations, comparisons, and cases to argue for waterborne cholera. Later research identified the bacterium *Vibrio cholerae* and confirmed that contaminated water can spread cholera. By ending with later confirmation, the account shows both the limits of Snow's evidence in 1854 and the importance of his method.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What purpose does the final sentence of paragraph 1 serve in the account's structure?

2 Why does paragraph 2 begin with the phrase "To test the pattern"?

3 How does the order of the evidence in paragraph 2 advance Snow's explanation?

4 How does paragraph 3 use the declining outbreak and later research to shape the reader's understanding of Snow's work?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a three-sentence, 75-95-word mini-account of an investigation. Begin with an observation and unanswered question, move to a comparison or test, and end with a qualified conclusion; use transitions that make each shift clear.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline words or phrases that signal a shift in the investigation, and number 1, 2, and 3 beside the sentences that introduce the problem, add evidence, and state the larger conclusion. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What purpose does the final sentence of paragraph 1 serve in the account's structure?	It explains that the map only suggested a connection and prepares readers for evidence that can distinguish Snow's explanation from other causes.
2	Why does paragraph 2 begin with the phrase "To test the pattern"?	The phrase signals a shift from Snow's first observation to comparisons that test whether the pump, rather than location alone, explains the deaths.
3	How does the order of the evidence in paragraph 2 advance Snow's explanation?	The nearby brewery and workhouse comparisons narrow the possible cause, then the Hampstead woman's case extends the evidence beyond the immediate neighborhood.
4	How does paragraph 3 use the declining outbreak and later research to shape the reader's understanding of Snow's work?	It qualifies the pump-handle action so it is not treated as proof, then uses later confirmation to show the importance and limits of Snow's evidence.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

At first, the robotics club noticed that its solar-powered model car stopped sooner on cloudy days, but the students still needed to learn whether weaker sunlight caused the problem or another part was failing. Next, they ran the car for equal distances under a lamp and outdoors, while keeping the battery, track, and motor settings the same. Therefore, the test supported their explanation, although repeated trials on several cloudy and sunny days would provide stronger evidence.

Accept equivalent descriptions of the passage's structural moves, as long as students explain how each move develops the explanation. For the open task, check for all three required stages, clear transitions, and a conclusion that recognizes a limit or need for further evidence.