Bottle Station Debate

Trace claims, reasons, and evidence in a school proposal.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RI.6.8 "Trace and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, distinguishing claims that are supported by reasons and evidence from claims that are not."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's main claim and each reason, circle evidence that supports a claim, and put a question mark beside any claim that has no evidence.

A Refill Station for the Gym Hallway

1. Our school should install a water-bottle filling station near the gym. The current fountain works, but it is too low for filling many reusable bottles. During five lunch periods, the Green Team counted 68 students waiting to use it. A filling station would let students refill bottles more quickly and might reduce the number of plastic bottles brought from home. Because students use the gym before, during, and after school, that hallway is the best place to begin.

2. Cost is a concern, but the idea has support. The principal's office received price quotes from two suppliers, ranging from $1,900 to $2,400 for a station with a filter. The school collected $1,150 from its spring walkathon, and the parent group voted to consider covering the rest. In an anonymous survey of 120 students, 93 said they would bring a reusable bottle more often if there were an easy place to refill it. These details show that both funding and student use are possible.

3. Some people say students can simply use the old fountain, so no new equipment is needed. However, the long lunch-time line gives a reason to test a faster option. The station would also make the school the cleanest school in the state, and every student would stop buying plastic bottles immediately. Those predictions sound exciting, but the letter gives no survey, study, or other evidence for them. The student council should review the costs, ask families for input, and then decide whether to install one station.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the writer's central argument?

2. What evidence supports the claim that students would use a filling station?

3. Name one prediction in the last paragraph that is not supported by evidence. Why is it unsupported?

4. Does the cost information fully prove that the school can pay for the station? Explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three-sentence recommendation to the student council. State whether it should install one filling station, use two pieces of evidence from the passage, and explain why one unsupported prediction should not guide the decision.

ANSWER KEY

Bottle Station Debate

GRADE 6 · RI.6.8

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's main claim and each reason, circle evidence that supports a claim, and put a question mark beside any claim that has no evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's central argument?	**The school should install a water-bottle filling station near the gym.**
2	What evidence supports the claim that students would use a filling station?	**In a survey of 120 students, 93 said they would bring a reusable bottle more often if an easy refill place were available.**
3	Name one prediction in the last paragraph that is not supported by evidence. Why is it unsupported?	**Possible answers: The station would make the school the cleanest in the state, or every student would stop buying plastic bottles immediately. The letter gives no survey, study, or other evidence for either prediction.**
4	Does the cost information fully prove that the school can pay for the station? Explain.	**No. The passage gives price quotes and says the school has $1,150, but the parent group only voted to consider covering the remaining cost, not to pay it.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend installing one filling station near the gym. The Green Team counted 68 students waiting during five lunch periods, and 93 of 120 surveyed students said they would bring reusable bottles more often with an easy refill place. I would not use the prediction that every student will stop buying plastic bottles, because the letter provides no evidence that this will happen.

Accept clear statements of the central claim and evidence that accurately matches a reason in the passage. For the unsupported prediction, accept either the cleanest-school claim or the every-student claim, as long as the student notes the lack of evidence.