

Manzanar Through Two Lenses

Compare a fictional scene with a historical account of Japanese American incarceration.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.RL.7.9 "Compare and contrast a fictional portrayal of a time, place, or character and a historical account of the same period as a means of understanding how authors of fiction use or alter history."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two details that make the fictional scene feel personal. Circle two factual details in the historical account, then number one story detail and one fact that describe a similar setting or condition.

Manzanar, 1942

- ① In the fictional story "Dust on the Suitcase," twelve-year-old Emi stands beside her family's suitcase at a crowded Los Angeles station in 1942. A soldier checks the tag on her coat, then points the family toward a crowded train. Emi clutches her sketchbook and imagines drawing the mountains beyond the windows. At Manzanar, she sees tar-paper barracks, windblown dust, and a long line for dinner. Her older brother whispers that he will make their small room feel like home, although Emi is not sure she believes him.
- ② The historical account explains that, after Japan attacked Pearl Harbor in December 1941, President Franklin D. Roosevelt signed Executive Order 9066 in February 1942. The order led to forced removal and incarceration of about 120,000 people of Japanese ancestry from the West Coast. Manzanar War Relocation Center, in California's Owens Valley, opened in 1942. People lived in barracks with limited privacy and faced dust storms, heat, and cold. The account does not follow one family's thoughts or name a child called Emi.
- ③ At Manzanar, the government required many residents to eat in communal mess halls and use shared latrines. Some residents worked in schools, farms, or offices within the camp. In 1943, the War Relocation Authority began asking adult residents to answer a loyalty questionnaire. The questions and policy caused conflict and worry for many people. The historical account gives information about camp conditions and government actions while leaving out private experiences of any one named family there.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What setting or condition appears in both portrayals? Explain how the fictional story presents it differently from the historical account.

2 Name two details that are likely invented for the fictional story. What evidence in the historical account supports your choice?

3 How does the historical account's use of the number about 120,000 people differ from the fictional story's focus on Emi?

4 How does focusing on Emi change a reader's understanding of the historical event described in the account?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Imagine that the fictional author adds a scene in which Emi waits in a mess hall. Write exactly three sentences explaining whether the scene would fit the historical account. Include one historical fact and explain how an invented detail could make that fact feel personal without claiming it happened to every family.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline two details that make the fictional scene feel personal. Circle two factual details in the historical account, then number one story detail and one fact that describe a similar setting or condition. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What setting or condition appears in both portrayals? Explain how the fictional story presents it differently from the historical account.	Both mention barracks and dust at Manzanar. The story shows them through Emi's observations, while the account describes them as conditions faced by many residents.
2	Name two details that are likely invented for the fictional story. What evidence in the historical account supports your choice?	Emi's sketchbook and her brother's promise are likely invented. The account says it does not name or follow one family or a child called Emi.
3	How does the historical account's use of the number about 120,000 people differ from the fictional story's focus on Emi?	The number shows the large scale of the forced removal and incarceration. Emi's story focuses on one imagined child's experience.
4	How does focusing on Emi change a reader's understanding of the historical event described in the account?	It can help readers picture personal feelings, such as uncertainty, during incarceration. The historical account explains broader facts, policies, and conditions.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A scene of Emi waiting in a mess hall would fit because the historical account says residents ate in communal mess halls. The author could show Emi noticing the noise or missing meals at home to make the policy feel personal. This scene should be presented as imagined, not as proof that every family had the same experience.

Accept other accurate shared conditions, such as Manzanar in 1942, barracks, or dust. For the open task, accept different invented personal details if the response clearly separates them from the historical fact.