Rethink the Plan

Use new evidence to adjust a claim during a discussion.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.1d "Acknowledge new information expressed by others, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views in light of the evidence presented."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each new piece of information, then number the sentences where a speaker acknowledges, revises, limits, or supports a view because of that information.

Forks, Facts, and a New Plan

1. At a student council meeting, Maya proposed replacing plastic forks in the cafeteria with compostable ones. She said the change could reduce trash because compostable forks are made from plant-based materials. Noah agreed that less plastic waste mattered, but he added new information: the school compost bin accepts food scraps only, not compostable utensils. If forks went into ordinary trash, he explained, they might not break down as Maya expected. Maya wrote down his point before responding.

2. Ms. Chen, the cafeteria manager, shared another fact. A nearby industrial composting facility accepts compostable utensils, but the school would need a separate collection bin and a pickup contract. She estimated that the contract would cost $40 each month. Maya acknowledged that this expense made an immediate switch less practical. However, she noted that the school already spends money hauling trash. She asked the council to compare both costs before deciding whether compostable forks would save money overall in the long run.

3. After hearing the evidence, Maya revised her proposal. Instead of asking for a schoolwide replacement right away, she suggested a six-week trial during one lunch period. Students would place used compostable forks in a labeled bin, and the facility would collect them. Maya said the trial could show whether students use the bin correctly and whether pickup costs fit the cafeteria budget. Noah supported the smaller test, saying it addressed his concern about forks being thrown into ordinary trash. The council voted to request price details before starting.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What new information does Noah add, and how does Maya show that she acknowledges it?

2. How does Ms. Chen's information cause Maya to qualify her original proposal?

3. What is Maya's revised proposal? Explain how it responds to the evidence the group discussed.

4. What two kinds of evidence would the trial gather before the council makes a final decision?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a school decision different from the fork discussion. Write three sentences, 45 to 60 words: state your view, acknowledge one new fact someone shares, and revise, limit, or defend your view using that fact.

ANSWER KEY

Rethink the Plan

GRADE 8 · SL.8.1d

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each new piece of information, then number the sentences where a speaker acknowledges, revises, limits, or supports a view because of that information. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What new information does Noah add, and how does Maya show that she acknowledges it?	**Noah explains that the school compost bin accepts only food scraps, so compostable forks in ordinary trash might not break down. Maya writes down his point before responding.**
2	How does Ms. Chen's information cause Maya to qualify her original proposal?	**Ms. Chen says the school would need a separate bin and a $40 monthly pickup contract. Maya says this makes an immediate switch less practical, but she wants the council to compare pickup costs with current trash-hauling costs.**
3	What is Maya's revised proposal? Explain how it responds to the evidence the group discussed.	**Maya proposes a six-week trial during one lunch period, using a labeled bin and collection by the facility. The smaller test addresses the risk that forks could go into ordinary trash and avoids making an immediate schoolwide change.**
4	What two kinds of evidence would the trial gather before the council makes a final decision?	**The trial would show whether students put forks in the bin correctly and whether pickup costs fit the cafeteria budget.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I think the library should stay open thirty minutes later on Thursdays. Jordan pointed out that the library has only one staff member after school, so keeping it open every day could leave that person without help. Because of that concern, I would begin with Thursdays and ask students to track how many people use the extra time.

Accept responses that accurately identify the new information and connect it to a speaker's changed, limited, or supported view. For Part 3, the response must include a clear view, a specific new fact from another person, and a justified revision, limitation, or defense.