

Listening Changes Plans

Track how speakers respond to evidence and revise a proposal.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.1d "Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each speaker's main claim, circle evidence or reasoning that supports it, and number the place where a speaker changes or qualifies a view so you can track agreements, disagreements, and revised thinking.

The First-Bell Debate

- ① At Jefferson High, the student council discussed moving the first bell from 7:25 to 8:05. Maya supported the change. She cited the American Academy of Pediatrics, which recommends that middle and high schools start at 8:30 or later to help adolescents get enough sleep. She argued that students who are less tired may participate more fully in class. However, she admitted that a later bell could complicate transportation and after-school jobs. Maya proposed checking bus schedules before making a final committee recommendation for all schools.
- ② Jordan opposed a districtwide change. He said his family shares one car, and his older sister drives him before starting her own job. A later opening, he explained, could force some families to arrange new rides or pay for care for younger children. Still, Jordan agreed with Maya that sleep affects learning and that the council should examine local evidence, not just personal stories. He suggested surveying students about bedtime, wake-up time, and transportation needs. His concern was not that sleep was unimportant, but that one schedule might create unequal burdens.
- ③ After hearing both students, Lena, the council chair, summarized an agreement: everyone wanted students to learn well, and everyone accepted that sleep matters. She also named the disagreement. Maya believed a later bell would probably improve classroom participation, while Jordan believed the transportation costs could outweigh that benefit for some families. Lena revised her earlier support for an immediate districtwide change. She now favored a pilot program at one school, paired with a transportation survey and attendance data. She connected Jordan's concern to Maya's goal: a plan that improves rest for some students but keeps others from arriving reliably may not improve learning overall.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What agreement does Lena summarize between Maya and Jordan?

2 What is the main disagreement between Maya and Jordan? Include one reason each student gives.

3 How does Lena revise her earlier view after hearing the discussion?

4 What connection does Lena make between Jordan's concern and Maya's goal? What conclusion does she draw from that connection?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

During a class discussion, Alina wants the cafeteria to stop using disposable plastic utensils because they create waste. Ben worries that reusable utensils could increase washing costs and lunch-line delays. In exactly four sentences, summarize their agreement and disagreement, state a qualified position, give a reason, and connect one concern to the other.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each speaker's main claim, circle evidence or reasoning that supports it, and number the place where a speaker changes or qualifies a view so you can track agreements, disagreements, and revised thinking. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What agreement does Lena summarize between Maya and Jordan?	They agree that students should learn well and that sleep matters.
2	What is the main disagreement between Maya and Jordan? Include one reason each student gives.	Maya supports a later start because rested students may participate more fully. Jordan worries that a later start could create transportation and child-care burdens for some families.
3	How does Lena revise her earlier view after hearing the discussion?	She moves from supporting an immediate districtwide change to supporting a one-school pilot with a transportation survey and attendance data.
4	What connection does Lena make between Jordan's concern and Maya's goal? What conclusion does she draw from that connection?	She connects reliable transportation to improved learning. She concludes that a plan may not improve learning overall if it helps some students rest but prevents others from arriving reliably.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Alina and Ben agree that the cafeteria should serve students responsibly, but they disagree about the best kind of utensil. I support replacing disposable plastic utensils, provided the school first tests whether its dishwashing system can handle the added items. Reducing plastic waste is a strong reason to change, especially because utensils are used every day. Ben's concern connects to Alina's goal: if washing causes long lines, students may avoid the reusable option or lose eating time.

Accept equivalent summaries that accurately identify shared concerns, contrasting positions, and the evidence or reasoning behind them. For Part 3, accept varied positions when the response includes all required elements and makes a logical connection between the two concerns.