

# Claim Check Challenge

*Test a speaker's ideas before you accept them.*

**HIGH SCHOOL • SL.9-10.3**

**CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.9-10.3** "Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, identifying any fallacious reasoning or exaggerated or distorted evidence."

NAME \_\_\_\_\_

DATE \_\_\_\_\_

## OUR GROUND RULES Read together first

|                                                                |                                             |
|----------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|
| <b>1</b> Use the speaker's words or ideas in your response.    | <b>2</b> Challenge ideas, not people.       |
| <b>3</b> Play a card only after you genuinely use its starter. | <b>4</b> Listen before you add a new point. |

## HOW TO PLAY Teams of 3 or 4

1. Choose one TOPIC card and read the speaker's statement aloud.
2. Choose different ROLE cards, then deal each player four MOVE cards.
3. Take turns using one starter to evaluate the speaker's view, reasoning, evidence, or rhetoric.
4. After you finish the starter, place that MOVE card in the middle and respond to the last idea.
5. Keep talking until every dealt card is in the middle, then complete the reflection.

## AFTER THE ROUND Check what you did

- ☐ I named the speaker's point of view.
- ☐ I tested whether a reason supported the claim.
- ☐ I judged the quality or limits of evidence.
- ☐ I noticed rhetoric, exaggeration, or faulty logic.


**TOPIC CARDS** · pick one per round

| TOPIC                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | TOPIC                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | TOPIC                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Later Start Debate</b><br>A speaker says, "Our school must start at 9:00 because every teen I know is tired, and schools with later starts always have better grades." What is convincing, questionable, or missing in this argument? | <b>Lunch Phone Ban</b><br>After one noisy lunch, a speaker says, "Phones ruin every lunch period, so the school should ban them at lunch. My cousin's school did, and everyone became friendlier." How strong is this argument, and why? | <b>Service Hours Rule</b><br>A speaker says, "Every student should complete 40 service hours to graduate. Volunteering builds character, and students who refuse simply do not care about their community." Which parts of this argument are supported, exaggerated, or unfair? |

**ROLE CARDS** · one per player

| ROLE                                                                                                   | ROLE                                                                                   | ROLE                                                                                             | ROLE                                                                                                 |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Claim Detective</b><br>Keep the group focused on what the speaker wants listeners to believe or do. | <b>Logic Scout</b><br>Check whether each reason actually supports the speaker's claim. | <b>Evidence Auditor</b><br>Ask whether the speaker's evidence is enough, reliable, and relevant. | <b>Rhetoric Radar</b><br>Spot loaded words, exaggeration, and language meant to influence listeners. |

**MOVE CARDS** · deal 4 to each player

|                                                                                                 |                                                                                                      |                                                                                                   |                                                                                                  |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>NAME VIEW</b><br>"The speaker's point of view is ____ because ____." | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>NAME VIEW</b><br>"The speaker wants listeners to ____, which shows ____." | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>TRACE REASON</b><br>"The reason ____ supports the claim because ____." | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>TRACE REASON</b><br>"One link is missing between ____ and ____."      |
| <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>CHECK EVIDENCE</b><br>"The evidence is ____ because ____."           | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>CHECK EVIDENCE</b><br>"To trust this evidence, I would need ____."        | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>SPOT LANGUAGE</b><br>"The words ____ may affect listeners by ____."    | <b>MOVE CARD</b><br><br><b>FLAG LOGIC</b><br>"The reasoning may be a ____ fallacy because ____." |

Print one card sheet per team. Cards last longer on thick paper.

**RUNNING THE ROUNDS**

Print two sets of MOVE cards for each group so every player can receive four cards. Run one TOPIC card per round and listen for explanations rather than one required conclusion. If participation is uneven, require every player to play one card before any player plays a second card.

**WHAT A STRONG ROUND SOUNDS LIKE**

|               |                                                                                                                   |
|---------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Maya</b>   | The speaker's point of view is that school should start at 9:00 because tired students may have trouble learning. |
| <b>Jordan</b> | One link is missing between students feeling tired and a 9:00 start being the best solution.                      |
| <b>Luis</b>   | The evidence is weak because the speaker only mentions teens the speaker knows.                                   |
| <b>Ava</b>    | The words "must" and "always" may affect listeners by making the conclusion sound certain.                        |
| <b>Maya</b>   | The reasoning may be a hasty generalization fallacy because a few tired teens cannot represent all students.      |

**LISTEN FOR**

- Names the claim and separates it from the evidence
- Explains why evidence is sufficient, limited, or unreliable
- Identifies a gap between a reason and a claim
- Points to loaded language, exaggeration, or a fallacy and explains its effect

There are no right answers to the topic cards. Score the moves students make, not their opinions.