The Refill Case

Follow a claim from evidence to reasoning.

ELA.5.R.2.4 "Track the development of an argument, identifying the specific claim(s), evidence, and reasoning."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's claim, circle each piece of evidence, and number the sentences that explain how the evidence supports the claim.

A Station for Reusable Bottles

1. Our school should add a water bottle refill station near the cafeteria. A refill station connects to the building's water line and quickly fills reusable bottles. Students already carry bottles to lunch, but the nearest fountain has a low spout that makes filling them slow. A station would make choosing tap water easier during the busiest part of the day.

2. During one lunch period, members of the Green Team counted 46 students waiting to use the fountain. Several students left with partly filled bottles when the line moved slowly. The team also surveyed 80 fifth graders, and 61 said they would refill a bottle at school if a faster station were available. These findings show that many students want a quicker option.

3. Refill stations can also reduce trash. Reusable bottles can be used many times, while single-use plastic bottles are thrown away after one use. If students refill bottles instead of buying disposable drinks, fewer empty bottles may end up in school trash cans. Because the station solves a daily problem and can cut waste, the principal should consider adding one.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the writer's main claim?

2. Give two specific pieces of evidence from paragraph 2 that support the claim.

3. How does paragraph 2 explain why the Green Team's findings support the claim?

4. What new support does paragraph 3 add to the argument, and how does it support the claim?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose one improvement for a shared school space. Write one claim, two pieces of evidence, and two sentences that explain why your evidence supports the claim.

ANSWER KEY

The Refill Case

GRADE 5 · ELA.5.R.2.4

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's claim, circle each piece of evidence, and number the sentences that explain how the evidence supports the claim. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's main claim?	**The school should add a water bottle refill station near the cafeteria.**
2	Give two specific pieces of evidence from paragraph 2 that support the claim.	**The Green Team counted 46 students waiting at the fountain, and 61 of 80 fifth graders said they would refill a bottle if a faster station were available.**
3	How does paragraph 2 explain why the Green Team's findings support the claim?	**The long wait and the survey results show that many students need and want a faster way to fill bottles.**
4	What new support does paragraph 3 add to the argument, and how does it support the claim?	**It adds that reusable bottles can reduce trash because they are used many times, while single-use bottles are thrown away. This gives the school an environmental reason to add a station.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Claim: Our school should add a covered bike rack near the main entrance. Evidence: During a one-week count, 18 bicycles were left outside, and rain soaked bike seats on three mornings. A covered rack would keep seats and handlebars drier, making it more comfortable for students to ride home. It would also make biking a more useful choice on rainy days.

Accept claims that clearly state a proposed improvement, evidence that is relevant and specific, and reasoning that connects the evidence to the claim. Evidence may come from observation, a survey, a count, or a reliable source.