

Monarchs in Three Voices

Compare how three genres present one science topic.

ELA.5.R.3 "Reading Across Genres"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one detail in each text that tells about monarch movement. Circle words or phrases that show how each genre presents the topic differently.

A Monarch Journey

- ① Text 1: Poem. A monarch's orange wings lift at dawn. "South," whispers the cool September air. It floats past a gold field, following sunlight over miles. By evening, it rests among trees, one small traveler in a wide, moving river of wings. Clouds drift like gray blankets above, but the butterfly keeps its bright path toward warmer places.
- ② Text 2: Field Journal. September 18. At the lakeshore, I watched monarchs gather on asters before noon. Their wings opened and closed in the sun. Later, the butterflies lifted together and headed southwest. I counted thirty in five minutes, but more passed beyond the trees. I wrote down the wind direction because it seemed to help their flight.
- ③ Text 3: Science Magazine Article. Each fall, monarch butterflies from eastern North America travel to central Mexico. In spring, surviving monarchs begin traveling north, but later generations continue the trip. The monarchs that leave in fall live much longer than summer monarchs, often six to nine months. They spend winter in mountain forests, where cool temperatures help them save energy.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 What idea about monarch movement appears in all three texts? Give one detail from each text.

2 How does Text 1 present monarch migration differently from Text 3? Use a detail from both texts.

3 What firsthand information does Text 2 add that Text 3 does not include?

4 Which text would best help a reader learn where eastern North American monarchs spend winter? Explain why.

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a four-sentence park announcement about monarch migration for visitors. Then write two sentences comparing your announcement with Text 1 and Text 2, explaining one way your genre uses language or details differently from each text.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline one detail in each text that tells about monarch movement. Circle words or phrases that show how each genre presents the topic differently. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What idea about monarch movement appears in all three texts? Give one detail from each text.	All three show monarchs traveling south in fall. Text 1 says the butterfly travels toward warmer places, Text 2 says the butterflies head southwest, and Text 3 says they travel to central Mexico.
2	How does Text 1 present monarch migration differently from Text 3? Use a detail from both texts.	Text 1 uses poetic images, such as the air that "whispers" and clouds like blankets. Text 3 uses scientific facts, including the trip to central Mexico and the monarchs' six-to-nine-month lifespan.
3	What firsthand information does Text 2 add that Text 3 does not include?	Text 2 gives the writer's personal observation at a lakeshore, including counting thirty monarchs in five minutes.
4	Which text would best help a reader learn where eastern North American monarchs spend winter? Explain why.	Text 3 would help most because the science article directly states that monarchs spend winter in mountain forests in central Mexico.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Monarch butterflies may pass through this park during fall migration. Look for orange-and-black wings on late-blooming flowers. Do not touch the butterflies while they feed or rest. Share your sightings with a park ranger. Unlike Text 1, this announcement gives visitors direct instructions instead of using images. Unlike Text 2, it does not describe one person's observation on a certain day.

Accept equivalent evidence showing that all three texts describe fall monarch migration. For comparisons, accept accurate references to the poem's imagery, the journal's firsthand observations, and the article's factual explanations.