Comments That Count

Use specific feedback and evidence to strengthen a shared proposal.

ELA.8.C.5 "Creating and Collaborating"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each comment that gives a writer a specific next step, and number each revision that responds to a comment. This shows how collaborators can improve a piece of writing.

A Stronger School Proposal

1 Maya's group was writing a proposal for more water-bottle refill stations at school. Maya drafted the opening: "Students need refill stations because they are useful." During a shared-document meeting, Devon highlighted the sentence and wrote, "Name a problem the stations would solve. Could you add evidence from our lunch survey?" Instead of changing the sentence himself, Devon gave Maya a clear next step. The group agreed that each writer would leave comments about ideas, evidence, or organization, then let the author decide how to revise.

2 Maya checked the survey notes before replying. She replaced her general claim with: "In our survey of 120 students, 68 said they sometimes skipped drinking water because the nearest fountain had a long line." Her revision gave readers a reason to care and identified the group's evidence. Lena then commented, "This statistic is strong, but explain how a refill station would shorten the wait." Maya added a sentence about stations filling bottles faster than standard fountains. She thanked Lena and marked the comment resolved only after making the change.

3 Before submitting the proposal, the group reread it together. Devon noticed that the conclusion repeated the survey number but did not ask for a decision. He suggested, "End by requesting that the principal consider one station near the cafeteria." The group discussed whether that location was practical, then checked a school map and chose the library entrance instead. Maya revised the final sentence to request a pilot station there. Their collaboration improved the proposal because comments were specific, writers used evidence, and the group explained the reasons for its choices.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Which comment gave Maya a clear next step for revising her opening, and what evidence did it ask her to use?

2. How did Maya change her opening claim after reading Devon's comment?

3. What did Lena ask Maya to explain, and what change did Maya make in response?

4. What problem did Devon identify in the conclusion, and how did the group revise the final request?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a two-sentence proposal asking for one improvement at your school. Then write one specific peer comment that asks for evidence or clearer reasoning, and revise one sentence in response to the comment.

ANSWER KEY

Comments That Count

GRADE 8 · ELA.8.C.5

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each comment that gives a writer a specific next step, and number each revision that responds to a comment. This shows how collaborators can improve a piece of writing. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which comment gave Maya a clear next step for revising her opening, and what evidence did it ask her to use?	**Devon's comment asked Maya to name a problem the stations would solve and add evidence from the lunch survey.**
2	How did Maya change her opening claim after reading Devon's comment?	**She replaced the general claim with survey evidence that 68 of 120 students sometimes skipped drinking water because the nearest fountain had a long line.**
3	What did Lena ask Maya to explain, and what change did Maya make in response?	**Lena asked how a refill station would shorten the wait. Maya added that stations fill bottles faster than standard fountains.**
4	What problem did Devon identify in the conclusion, and how did the group revise the final request?	**Devon said the conclusion did not ask for a decision. After checking the map, the group changed the request to a pilot station near the library entrance.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Draft: Our school should add a covered bike rack near the east entrance. Many students leave bicycles in the rain or lock them to fences. Peer comment: Add evidence that shows how many students would use the rack. Revision: Our school should add a covered bike rack near the east entrance because a survey of 54 students found that 31 ride bicycles to school at least once a week.

Accept answers that accurately identify the feedback, the related revision, and the evidence or reasoning used. For the open task, accept varied school improvements if the student includes a two-sentence proposal, an actionable peer comment, and a revision that responds to it.