Decision Evidence Check

Analyze how a decision text connects claims, evidence, and limits.

10.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the board's claim, circle each piece of evidence, and number each limit or caution. These marks will help you judge how strongly the conclusion is supported.

Should the Bell Ring Later?

1. At 7:20 each morning, buses pull into Northview High while many students are still waking up. The school board is considering a 30-minute later start, a change that would move first period to 8:20. Supporters point to guidance from the American Academy of Pediatrics, which recommends that middle and high schools begin at 8:30 or later to support adolescent sleep. In a student survey last spring, 62 percent of Northview respondents said they usually slept fewer than eight hours on school nights. The survey describes students' experiences, but it does not prove that a later bell would improve grades or attendance.

2. Opponents raise practical concerns. A later dismissal could push sports practices into darkness, complicate family pickup schedules, and limit after-school jobs. Those costs matter, yet they are predictions, not measurements from Northview. The board could compare them with evidence from a one-semester trial. It might track first period absences, tardiness, sleep reports, and participation in activities, then compare those results with the same semester from the previous year. Because weather, course schedules, and team seasons can also affect these numbers, the board should avoid treating one change as the only cause. A trial would provide stronger local evidence than the survey alone.

3. A useful decision text would place the proposal, evidence, limits, and next step in separate sections. For example, the board's claim could be that a later start deserves testing, not that it is guaranteed to solve every problem. The sleep recommendation and survey results support testing, while the predicted scheduling costs and possible outside influences limit certainty. After the trial, the board should publish its measures and explain how each result affected its choice. Readers can then judge whether the evidence matches the conclusion. This structure turns a debate into an argument that can be examined, questioned, and revised.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the board's main claim about a later school start? Name one piece of evidence that supports testing the claim.

2. Why does the passage say that the student survey cannot prove that a later start would improve grades or attendance?

3. How does the proposed one-semester trial make the board's analysis stronger than relying on the survey alone?

4. Write one sentence that states a careful rule the board should use before deciding whether to change the start time. Include both needed evidence and a possible outside influence.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a school change that matters to you. Write a four-line decision card with a claim, one specific piece of evidence and its source, one limitation, and a next step that would help decision makers evaluate the claim.

ANSWER KEY

Decision Evidence Check

GRADE 10 · 10.P.EICC.2.d

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the board's claim, circle each piece of evidence, and number each limit or caution. These marks will help you judge how strongly the conclusion is supported. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the board's main claim about a later school start? Name one piece of evidence that supports testing the claim.	**The board's claim is that a later start deserves testing, not that it is guaranteed to solve every problem. Supporting evidence includes the American Academy of Pediatrics recommendation for starts at 8:30 or later or the survey finding that 62 percent of respondents slept fewer than eight hours.**
2	Why does the passage say that the student survey cannot prove that a later start would improve grades or attendance?	**The survey reports students' sleep experiences, but it does not measure what would happen to grades or attendance after a later start.**
3	How does the proposed one-semester trial make the board's analysis stronger than relying on the survey alone?	**The trial would collect local data on absences, tardiness, sleep, and activity participation and compare it with data from the previous year.**
4	Write one sentence that states a careful rule the board should use before deciding whether to change the start time. Include both needed evidence and a possible outside influence.	**The board should compare trial data on absences, tardiness, sleep, and activities with prior-year data while considering outside influences such as weather, course schedules, and team seasons.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Claim: Northview should add a water-refill station near the gym. Evidence and source: A two-week count by the athletics office found that 146 students bought bottled water after practices. Limitation: The count did not include students who brought water bottles or practices canceled by rain. Next step: Track refill-station use and bottled-water purchases for one season before deciding whether to add more stations.

Accept equivalent statements that accurately distinguish evidence from predictions or limits in the passage. For the decision card, accept varied school issues if the response includes all four required parts and the limitation genuinely qualifies the evidence.