Draft Under Review

Use feedback and self-review to judge whether a draft meets its purpose.

10.P.EICC.4.f "Evaluate the text's effectiveness based on self-review or feedback from others, determining whether the text matches the purpose and goals for writing. (C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's stated purpose and goals. Circle each revision or remaining need that shows whether the editorial meets them.

A Persuasive Editorial Revised

1. For the student newspaper, Maya drafted a 250-word editorial asking the school board to add shaded seating near the bus loop. Her purpose was to persuade board members, who control campus improvements, to fund the project before next summer. She set two goals: explain why students need shade and propose a realistic action. Her first draft opened with a funny story about a melted chocolate bar, then described students waiting in afternoon heat. It ended by demanding that the board "fix this now," but it gave no cost, plan, or source for its temperature claim.

2. During peer review, Jordan said the heat description made the problem clear, but the opening joke could make officials dismiss the issue. He also wrote, "Show what the school can do, not only what you want." Maya used a campus map to estimate that three shade structures would cover the busiest waiting area. She checked a district facilities report and found that the board had recently approved similar structures at another school. Her teacher praised these sources but asked Maya to explain how the examples connected to her own campus. Maya then compared the bus loop's lack of trees with the shaded pickup area at that school.

3. In her revised editorial, Maya replaced the joke with a brief account of a student who fainted while waiting for a delayed bus, and she cited the district report for local summer temperatures. She proposed that the board request price estimates, choose locations, and include the structures in its next facilities budget. Before submitting, Maya reread the editorial against her purpose and goals. She decided it now gave board members a reason to act and a manageable next step. However, she noted that the article still needed a direct link to the facilities report so readers could verify the information.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Evaluate Maya's first draft against her purpose and two goals. What made it only partly effective?

2. How did Jordan's feedback about showing what the school can do improve Maya's ability to meet her purpose?

3. Evaluate whether Maya's revised editorial meets her goal of explaining why students need shade. Use two details from the passage.

4. What remaining weakness does Maya identify in her self-review, and why would fixing it make the editorial more effective?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a draft you have written. In exactly four sentences, state its purpose and two goals, describe one piece of feedback or self-review, name a revision, and evaluate whether the revision will help the draft meet its purpose.

ANSWER KEY

Draft Under Review

GRADE 10 · 10.P.EICC.4.f

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's stated purpose and goals. Circle each revision or remaining need that shows whether the editorial meets them. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Evaluate Maya's first draft against her purpose and two goals. What made it only partly effective?	**It explained that students waited in heat, but the joke could weaken the serious purpose. It did not provide evidence or a realistic action plan for the board.**
2	How did Jordan's feedback about showing what the school can do improve Maya's ability to meet her purpose?	**It pushed Maya to add a specific, manageable proposal: request price estimates, choose locations, and place the structures in the next facilities budget.**
3	Evaluate whether Maya's revised editorial meets her goal of explaining why students need shade. Use two details from the passage.	**It meets the goal because it includes the account of a student fainting while waiting for a delayed bus and cites a district report about local summer temperatures.**
4	What remaining weakness does Maya identify in her self-review, and why would fixing it make the editorial more effective?	**The editorial needs a direct link to the facilities report. Adding it would let readers verify the evidence and strengthen the editorial's credibility.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

My email to the principal asks for a quieter study space in the library. Its goals are to explain how noise affects students and to suggest a practical change. A classmate said my description was convincing but my request was too broad, so I will recommend reserving one back table for silent work during lunch. After this revision, the email should match its purpose because it gives the principal evidence and a specific action to consider.

Accept supported evaluations that connect a detail from the draft, feedback, or revision to Maya's purpose or goals. For the open response, accept different writing topics when all required parts appear in exactly four sentences.