Before You Believe

Evaluate claims, sources, and competing evidence before a decision.

10.T.RA.2.b "Analyze information from a variety of sources by identifying misconceptions, conflicting information or perspectives, and/or author bias and verifying the validity, relevancy, and accuracy of the information being considered. (I)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each claim a source makes. Circle details about the source, its evidence, or its setting, then write matching numbers beside sources that give conflicting predictions.

Brookdale's Start-Time Decision

(1) When Brookdale High proposed moving its first bell from 7:25 to 8:20, the school board gathered sources about sleep, attendance, and transportation. A student council poll of 312 volunteers found that 71 percent favored the change. The poll was shared through the council's social-media account during exam week. Its question asked, "Would you support a healthier, later school start?" The district attendance office reported that first-period absences averaged 8.4 percent during the previous school year. That report listed monthly totals but did not separate absences caused by illness, late buses, or appointments.

(2) TransitPath, the company that holds Brookdale's current bus contract, submitted a planning memo. Using its 2022 route map, the memo estimated that an 8:20 start would require 14 additional buses and raise annual costs by $1.1 million. It assumed elementary schools would keep their present schedules. In a separate email, the district transportation director wrote that staggering elementary and high school times could use the existing fleet, although the email gave no route calculations. Both sources addressed buses, but they began with different schedule assumptions.

(3) A regional university research center analyzed attendance records from six districts that shifted high school start times between 2018 and 2021. Its report found lower first-period absence rates in four districts, while two showed little change. The report did not include Brookdale, and the districts ranged from rural communities to a large city. A parent blog posted a chart beside the report and claimed that "teens need the same amount of sleep as adults." The post named no study. The board must decide which information is accurate, relevant to Brookdale, and worth checking before it votes.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Identify the two sources that make conflicting predictions about buses. What difference in their assumptions or evidence may explain the conflict?

2. Which source may have a perspective that could affect its transportation prediction? Use one detail from the passage to explain your reasoning.

3. Which source needs verification before the board uses it to make a claim about teen sleep? Give two details from the passage that support your choice.

4. How is the university research report relevant to Brookdale's decision, and what is one limit on using it to predict Brookdale's results?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a source not in the passage about later school start times. In 2 or 3 sentences, name the source and author, state one claim, identify one possible perspective or limitation, and explain one step you would take to verify its accuracy or relevance to Brookdale.

ANSWER KEY

Before You Believe

GRADE 10 · 10.T.RA.2.b

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each claim a source makes. Circle details about the source, its evidence, or its setting, then write matching numbers beside sources that give conflicting predictions. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Identify the two sources that make conflicting predictions about buses. What difference in their assumptions or evidence may explain the conflict?	**TransitPath predicts 14 additional buses, while the transportation director says staggered times could use the existing fleet. TransitPath assumes elementary schedules stay the same, while the director assumes they can change, and the director provides no route calculations.**
2	Which source may have a perspective that could affect its transportation prediction? Use one detail from the passage to explain your reasoning.	**TransitPath may have a perspective that could affect its prediction because it holds Brookdale's current bus contract and predicts a need for additional buses and higher costs.**
3	Which source needs verification before the board uses it to make a claim about teen sleep? Give two details from the passage that support your choice.	**The parent blog needs verification. It makes a broad claim about teen sleep and names no study to support that claim.**
4	How is the university research report relevant to Brookdale's decision, and what is one limit on using it to predict Brookdale's results?	**It is relevant because it examines attendance after high schools changed start times. Its limits are that Brookdale was not included and the studied districts had different community settings.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The American Academy of Pediatrics policy statement "School Start Times for Adolescents," published in Pediatrics in 2014, recommends that middle and high schools start at 8:30 a.m. or later. Because a pediatric organization focuses on adolescent health, I would compare its recommendation with Brookdale's transportation and attendance data before deciding whether it fits locally.

Accept other well-supported analyses when students cite accurate passage details and explain their reasoning. For the open task, accept a credible source and a specific verification step, even if the student identifies a different reasonable limitation or perspective.