

Decision by Design

Analyze how evidence and options shape a public recommendation.

11.P.EICC.2.e "Consume and produce texts in order to solve problems or influence decisions. (I/C)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each fact or estimate that supports the recommendation. Circle the requested decision, and number the parts that answer likely concerns about cost, timing, or alternatives.

A Shade Plan for Bus Riders

- ① At our four busiest bus stops, students wait in direct sun for as long as 25 minutes during August and September. Last fall, the nurse recorded 18 heat-related visits from students who arrived from these routes, although the records do not prove where every illness began. We surveyed 146 riders, and 121 said they had no shaded place to wait. This problem affects attendance, comfort, and safety. We recommend installing shade canopies before next school year, beginning with the stops serving the largest number of riders.
- ② District facilities staff estimate that four steel canopies would cost \$32,000, including installation. The transportation budget has \$20,000 available this year, so we propose a two-stage plan: build two canopies now and seek a local health grant for the remaining cost. Moving bus times earlier would cost less, but it would not protect students on hot spring afternoons or during delayed pickups. Planting trees could add shade eventually, yet young trees need years to grow and regular watering. The phased canopy plan addresses the immediate risk while keeping the board within its current budget.
- ③ We ask the board to vote on the two-stage plan at its May meeting. A May decision would let the district order materials before summer demand raises delivery times, and the first two canopies could be ready by August. If the grant is not awarded, the board could review the second stage during next year's budget process rather than canceling the project. This choice does not solve every heat concern, but it gives the riders with the longest waits practical protection soon. Please approve \$20,000 for the first stage and authorize the grant application today.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 What specific decision does the Student Transit Council want the board to make?

2 Identify two pieces of evidence the council uses to show that riders need shade soon. Explain how each piece supports the recommendation.

3 Why does the passage discuss earlier bus times and planting trees? How does that comparison support the canopy plan?

4 How does the plan for an unawarded grant address a possible concern about spending?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a 100-130 word recommendation to a school decision maker about a problem you choose. State the decision you want, use two specific pieces of evidence, address one cost, limit, or alternative, and propose a realistic next step.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each fact or estimate that supports the recommendation. Circle the requested decision, and number the parts that answer likely concerns about cost, timing, or alternatives. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What specific decision does the Student Transit Council want the board to make?	Approve \$20,000 for the first two canopies and authorize a grant application for the remaining canopies.
2	Identify two pieces of evidence the council uses to show that riders need shade soon. Explain how each piece supports the recommendation.	Any two: students wait up to 25 minutes in direct sun; 18 heat-related nurse visits involved students from these routes; 121 of 146 surveyed riders reported no shaded waiting place. Each suggests a current heat-related concern for riders.
3	Why does the passage discuss earlier bus times and planting trees? How does that comparison support the canopy plan?	It considers less expensive or longer-term alternatives, then shows that neither provides reliable immediate shade. This makes the phased canopy plan appear more practical.
4	How does the plan for an unawarded grant address a possible concern about spending?	The board could review the second stage in next year's budget process instead of committing current funds beyond the available \$20,000 or canceling the whole project.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

To: Principal Ortega Our library closes at 3:15, even though 68 students reported needing a quiet place to wait for late rides or athletic practices. In a three-day count, an average of 31 students sat in the noisy cafeteria after school. I recommend keeping the library open until 4:30 on Tuesdays and Thursdays. Hiring staff every afternoon may cost too much, but the existing homework club adviser could supervise with a rotating teacher volunteer. The school could try this schedule for six weeks and track attendance. If at least 20 students use the space each day, the principal should continue the program through next semester.

Accept evidence-based answers that accurately connect the passage's facts, alternatives, and contingency plan to the requested decision. For Part 3, accept varied school issues if the response meets the word range and includes a clear decision, two specific pieces of evidence, a limitation or alternative, and a feasible next step.