

Lights, Lives, Views

Compare how different texts shape a coastal lighting debate.

11.T.C.2.a “Compare and contrast varying perspectives on a particular topic found across a variety of texts, analyzing how texts establish and develop perspective to shape perceptions or beliefs. (I)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each text's central claim, circle the details used to support it, and number 1, 2, or 3 beside clues that show how each text's genre or evidence shapes its perspective.

Three Views on Beach Lighting

- ① In a field report, marine biologist Dr. Lena Ortiz describes dawn surveys on a Florida beach. She notes that sea turtle hatchlings usually move toward the brightest horizon, which historically was moonlight reflecting over the ocean. Hotel windows, parking lots, and walkways can create brighter inland paths. Ortiz argues that coastal communities should require shielded, low-mounted lights and reduce unnecessary lighting during nesting season. Her report uses observations and biology terms to present the issue as an urgent survival problem rather than a matter of visitor preference.
- ② In an opinion column, the Seaside Hotel Association agrees that hatchlings need darker beaches, but it questions a blanket lighting rule. The column warns that guests and workers need clear paths near entrances, stairs, and parking areas after sunset. It also says that rapid, expensive renovations could burden small, family-run motels during a busy season. Instead of focusing on biological research, the writers use business costs and visitor safety to frame the issue as a practical management problem. They support timed lights, motion sensors, and grants that would help properties replace fixtures without losing needed visibility.
- ③ At a town council hearing, high school student Maya Reed supports stronger lighting rules, but she rejects the idea that safety and conservation must compete. She recalls walking past a brightly lit dune access where hatchling tracks led toward a road, then points to a nearby boardwalk with downward-facing lamps. That example, she argues, shows that design choices can protect people and wildlife. Reed asks the council to consult hotel staff, scientists, and residents before voting. Her testimony combines a personal scene with a call for shared responsibility, shaping the audience to see compromise as possible.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What goal do Ortiz and the Seaside Hotel Association share, and what do they disagree about?

2 How does Ortiz's field report establish the perspective that beach lighting is an urgent problem?

3 How does the Hotel Association's opinion column frame the lighting issue differently from Ortiz's report?

4 How does Reed's use of a personal example shape the audience differently from Ortiz's use of scientific observations?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose a school or community issue. In 90 to 120 words, compare two imagined texts about that issue, identifying each text's perspective, the evidence or technique it uses, and how it may shape readers' beliefs.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each text's central claim, circle the details used to support it, and number 1, 2, or 3 beside clues that show how each text's genre or evidence shapes its perspective. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What goal do Ortiz and the Seaside Hotel Association share, and what do they disagree about?	Both support darker beaches that protect hatchlings. Ortiz favors required lighting changes, while the association opposes a blanket rule and stresses safety, costs, and assistance for businesses.
2	How does Ortiz's field report establish the perspective that beach lighting is an urgent problem?	It uses dawn-survey observations and biology-based information about hatchlings moving toward bright horizons, framing artificial light as a survival threat.
3	How does the Hotel Association's opinion column frame the lighting issue differently from Ortiz's report?	The column frames it as a business and safety management problem by emphasizing clear paths, renovation costs, and practical solutions such as sensors and grants.
4	How does Reed's use of a personal example shape the audience differently from Ortiz's use of scientific observations?	Reed makes the issue concrete and supports compromise through a firsthand scene and a workable design example. Ortiz builds urgency through scientific observation and biological explanation.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A principal's memo argues for a later school start because buses could run after elementary routes. Its calm, logistical language presents the change as manageable, so families may focus on scheduling. A student editorial supports the same change for a different reason, describing classmates who fall asleep in first period and citing research on teen sleep. The personal examples make the issue feel immediate, while the research builds credibility. Although both texts favor a later start, the memo invites readers to consider operations, and the editorial invites them to consider students' health and daily experience.

Accept answers that accurately identify each perspective and connect specific evidence, language, or genre choices to the way a text frames the issue. For the open response, accept varied issues and viewpoints if the student compares two texts and explains how each could influence an audience.