

Clashing Bell Times

Separate evidence from policy judgments.

11.T.T.2.b "Analyze and evaluate texts with conflicting information or opposing viewpoints and determine where the texts disagree on matters of fact or interpretations. (I)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each claim that could be checked with evidence, circle each judgment about the proposal, and write the same number beside claims that conflict.

Two Views on a Later Start

- ① Riverton's school board is considering moving the high school's first bell from 7:35 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. In a written comment, pediatrician Mara Lin supports the change. She cites the American Academy of Pediatrics recommendation that middle and high schools begin at 8:30 a.m. or later to support adolescent sleep. Lin says that many Riverton teenagers are not getting enough sleep and cites a district survey in which 62 percent of students reported sleeping fewer than eight hours on school nights. She estimates that staggered elementary routes would require three additional buses. Lin calls the change a practical investment in attendance and learning.
- ② Transportation manager Elena Ortiz opposes the proposal in a separate report. Ortiz agrees that many teenagers do not get enough sleep, but she argues that a later bell would not automatically produce more sleep. She points to a student poll showing that 41 percent of respondents spend at least two hours nightly on homework, jobs, or activities, not counting screen time. Using current driver contracts and route maps, Ortiz calculates that the district would need eighteen additional buses, not three. She interprets the added cost as a threat to arts and career programs, which could lose funding if transportation expenses rise.
- ③ Both documents were submitted before the board requested a transportation audit. Neither document includes a dollar estimate for buses, a proposed elementary schedule, or records showing what students would do with later evenings. Lin's estimate assumes that elementary routes can be staggered without major changes. Ortiz's estimate assumes that driver contracts and route maps stay as they are. The board will vote after receiving route schedules and cost projections. Its chair says that attendance records and student sleep surveys will be reviewed one year after any schedule change.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What claim do Lin and Ortiz both make about Riverton teenagers? Is this claim a matter of fact or an interpretation?

2 State the conflicting claims about additional buses. What assumption does each writer use?

3 How does each writer interpret the effect of a later bell on district resources?

4 Which document gives more direct evidence about student sleep, and what missing evidence limits both documents?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a 90 to 120 word memo to the board. Distinguish one factual disagreement from one interpretive disagreement, name evidence that could test the factual disagreement, and recommend a next step without choosing a final bell time.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each claim that could be checked with evidence, circle each judgment about the proposal, and write the same number beside claims that conflict. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What claim do Lin and Ortiz both make about Riverton teenagers? Is this claim a matter of fact or an interpretation?	Both say that many teenagers do not get enough sleep. It is a factual claim because sleep data could support or challenge it.
2	State the conflicting claims about additional buses. What assumption does each writer use?	Lin estimates three additional buses, assuming elementary routes can be staggered. Ortiz estimates eighteen additional buses, assuming current driver contracts and route maps remain unchanged.
3	How does each writer interpret the effect of a later bell on district resources?	Lin calls it a practical investment in attendance and learning. Ortiz sees the added transportation cost as a threat to arts and career programs.
4	Which document gives more direct evidence about student sleep, and what missing evidence limits both documents?	Lin's document gives more direct evidence because it cites an adolescent-sleep recommendation and a survey about students' sleep. Both documents lack records showing what students would do with later evenings.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The board should separate the bus dispute from the policy judgments. Lin predicts three extra buses if elementary routes are staggered, while Ortiz predicts eighteen under current contracts and maps. The district should obtain proposed route schedules, contract terms, and price estimates to test those competing projections. The writers also interpret the consequences differently: Lin sees a practical investment, and Ortiz sees a possible loss for arts and career programs. Before selecting a bell time, the board should compare the transportation costs with attendance data and collect sleep surveys after any pilot schedule.

Accept equivalent descriptions of the writers' conflicting bus projections and their contrasting policy judgments. For the memo, look for a clear distinction between a checkable claim and an interpretation, plus relevant evidence and a logical next step.