

Evidence Before Action

Use different texts to shape a responsible recommendation.

12.P.EICC.2.b “Make use of texts to build knowledge, develop skills, make informed decisions, and share information and ideas. (I/C)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline details that help the council or board make a decision. In the margin, label each detail H for health evidence, L for local experience, O for an operational constraint, or N for needed information.

Should Riverton Start Later?

- ① At Riverton High, a student advisory council asked whether the school day should begin later. Before taking a position, members read three texts. A district transportation memo explained that bus routes are shared with middle schools, so changing one schedule can affect another. A study summary from the American Academy of Pediatrics described adolescent sleep patterns and recommended that middle and high schools aim for start times of 8:30 a.m. or later. A survey report showed that 62 percent of Riverton students who responded said they usually sleep fewer than eight hours on school nights.
- ② Council members did not treat the texts as interchangeable. The medical recommendation supplied a health-based benchmark, while the survey described local students' reported experience. Neither text settled the transportation question. To understand that constraint, the council highlighted the memo's explanation of shared routes and wrote a question in the margin: Which schedule changes would preserve reliable bus service? They also noted limits in the survey. It reported responses from students who chose to answer, not sleep data from every student. By separating a recommendation, local testimony, and an operational constraint, the group built a more complete picture.
- ③ At the next meeting, the council prepared a one-page briefing for the school board. Its opening sentence stated the decision under discussion, not a conclusion. Then the briefing paired each claim with the text that supported it. For example, the council could explain why later starts deserve consideration by citing the medical benchmark and the local survey, while also explaining why a change may be difficult by citing shared bus routes. The final section listed information the board still needed, including possible route plans, effects on middle-school schedules, and responses from families. The briefing allowed board members to compare evidence, uncertainty, and practical consequences before deciding.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 How did the medical study summary and the student survey serve different purposes for the council?

2 What transportation constraint did the council identify, and what question did it ask to investigate that constraint?

3 Why did the council treat the survey results as limited evidence rather than evidence about every student?

4 What three things did the briefing allow school board members to compare before making a decision?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a 90-120-word recommendation note to the school board using only the passage. Take a provisional position on a later start, use at least two texts from the passage, address the bus-route constraint, and name one piece of information the board still needs.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline details that help the council or board make a decision. In the margin, label each detail H for health evidence, L for local experience, O for an operational constraint, or N for needed information. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How did the medical study summary and the student survey serve different purposes for the council?	The study summary provided a health-based benchmark for school start times. The survey described Riverton students' reported sleep experience.
2	What transportation constraint did the council identify, and what question did it ask to investigate that constraint?	High school bus routes are shared with middle schools, so changing one schedule can affect another. The council asked which schedule changes would preserve reliable bus service.
3	Why did the council treat the survey results as limited evidence rather than evidence about every student?	The survey included only students who chose to respond, not sleep data from every student.
4	What three things did the briefing allow school board members to compare before making a decision?	Evidence, uncertainty, and practical consequences.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The board should continue studying a later high school start rather than adopt a schedule immediately. The medical study summary gives a health-based reason to consider an 8:30 a.m. or later start, and the student survey suggests that many Riverton respondents sleep fewer than eight hours on school nights. However, the transportation memo shows that high school bus routes are connected to middle-school routes. Before choosing a plan, the board should compare possible route plans and examine effects on middle-school schedules. This approach uses the available evidence while recognizing that the survey does not represent every student.

Accept responses that accurately distinguish among the health recommendation, local survey evidence, transportation constraint, and remaining information needs. For Part 3, accept different provisional positions if the response uses passage evidence accurately, addresses transportation, and identifies a stated information need.