

The Evidence Ledger

Annotate claims, support, and uncertainty before making a judgment.

12.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each claim about the project, circle each piece of evidence or named source, and put a question mark beside each stated limit or uncertainty. These marks help you separate support from claims that still need testing.

A Cooler Block, at What Cost?

- ① At a city council meeting, planners proposed replacing two blocks of dark asphalt around Lincoln Transit Center with lighter pavement, shade trees, and covered bus shelters. Their brief argues that the project would make walking safer during hotter summers, especially for riders who wait outdoors. The brief cites temperature readings taken at 3 p.m. on a clear June day: the unshaded pavement measured 136°F, while a nearby shaded sidewalk measured 92°F. Because dark surfaces absorb more solar energy than light or shaded surfaces, the contrast supports the planners' concern. Still, one afternoon's readings cannot predict conditions throughout the year.
- ② Opponents focus on cost and disruption. A neighborhood business association estimates that construction could reduce curb access for four months, and it asks the council to repair existing potholes first. Its statement also notes that young trees provide limited shade until their canopies grow. In response, planners do not claim an instant solution. They propose scheduling work outside the holiday shopping season and installing shelters before pavement work begins. The brief frames these steps as safeguards, not proof that every business will avoid losses. This concession makes the proposal seem more cautious, but it leaves the association's estimate unverified.
- ③ Before voting, council members need a text that compares benefits, costs, and uncertainty rather than repeats either side's language. A useful decision chart could list each claim, the source behind it, the evidence needed, and the people affected. For example, the temperature comparison has a named measurement and a clear relevance to waiting riders, yet it needs readings from more days and locations. The business association's four-month estimate identifies a possible harm, but the passage does not explain its method. Such a chart would not choose the project automatically. It would help readers judge which claims are supported, which are assumptions, and what additional information could change the decision.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What action do the planners recommend, and which temperature measurement do they use to support that recommendation?

2 Why does the passage say that the temperature comparison is not enough to predict conditions throughout the year?

3 How do the planners respond to the business association's concern, and what does the passage say their response does not prove?

4 What would a decision chart add to the passage's discussion of the business association's four-month estimate?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose a proposed change at your school or in your community. Create a four-row decision chart with these columns: claim, source or evidence, limitation or question, and affected group. Include at least one possible benefit and one possible cost or concern.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each claim about the project, circle each piece of evidence or named source, and put a question mark beside each stated limit or uncertainty. These marks help you separate support from claims that still need testing. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What action do the planners recommend, and which temperature measurement do they use to support that recommendation?	They recommend replacing two blocks of dark asphalt with lighter pavement, shade trees, and covered bus shelters. They cite 136°F on unshaded pavement and 92°F on a nearby shaded sidewalk.
2	Why does the passage say that the temperature comparison is not enough to predict conditions throughout the year?	The readings were taken during only one afternoon, so they do not show temperatures across different days, seasons, or locations.
3	How do the planners respond to the business association's concern, and what does the passage say their response does not prove?	They propose working outside the holiday shopping season and installing shelters first. Their response does not prove that every business will avoid losses.
4	What would a decision chart add to the passage's discussion of the business association's four-month estimate?	It would identify the estimate's source, ask for the method or evidence behind it, and show which affected groups might experience the claimed harm.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Sample chart for a hypothetical later school-start proposal: Claim | Source or evidence | Limitation or question | Affected group A later start could improve first-period alertness. | Student survey about sleep and morning fatigue | Self-reports do not prove that start time causes fatigue. | Students and teachers A later start could create bus-route conflicts. | Transportation office's proposed route schedule | The district needs exact cost and timing estimates. | Drivers, students, and families A later start could reduce time for after-school activities. | Athletics and club schedules | Some activities may be rescheduled rather than reduced. | Athletes, club members, and coaches A later start could make family schedules harder to manage. | Family comments from a public meeting | More families need to be surveyed before treating this concern as widespread. | Families and caregivers

Accept accurate paraphrases that distinguish a claim from its evidence and identify the passage's stated limits. For the chart, accept varied proposals if all four rows include the required columns and show evaluative thinking about support, uncertainty, and affected groups.