

Shade, Streets, Stories

Compare how three sources shape views of a city tree-planting plan.

12.T.C.2.a “Compare and contrast varying perspectives on a particular topic found across a variety of texts, analyzing how texts establish and develop perspective to shape perceptions or beliefs. (1)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB In each text, underline the sentence that most clearly states or implies the source's position. Circle two details, such as an example, image, or word choice, that build that position.

Who Should Shape the Shade?

- ① Text A, from a city public-health briefing: “During heat waves, pavement and roofs can hold heat long after sunset. Neighborhoods with little tree cover often have hotter surfaces than leafier areas. The city should plant shade trees first near bus stops, playgrounds, and apartment blocks, where people spend time outdoors. Trees are not a complete solution, but their shade can reduce exposure while longer-term cooling plans are built. A planting program needs watering funds and paid local crews, because a dead sapling offers no shade. The question is not whether trees are attractive. It is whether every resident can reach shade on a hot day.”
- ② Text B, from an op-ed by a repair-shop owner: “My shop faces a wide, treeless street, and last July its metal doors stayed hot into the evening. I want more trees, but the proposed plan removes parking spaces used for deliveries. When customers cannot unload equipment, a day’s work disappears. City leaders should first repair broken bus shelters and open cooling centers during heat alerts. Then they can plant trees where roots will not buckle sidewalks, and they should publish a maintenance budget before approving a large rollout. A young tree may help the next generation, but my employees need safe, usable streets this summer.”
- ③ Text C, from captions in a student photo essay called “After the Bell”: “At 6:10 p.m., students carry buckets between the basketball court and the curb. One photograph shows Maya tying blue ribbons to the empty squares where volunteers hope to plant. ‘Each ribbon marks a place we cross every day,’ her caption reads. Another image places a small seedling beside an older neighbor holding a watering can. The final photograph looks down the block as families add their names to a watering schedule. Its caption says, ‘We are not waiting for someone else to make our walk home cooler.’”

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

- 1 How does Text A establish its perspective on tree planting? Identify one priority it names and one language or evidence choice that supports that priority, then explain the effect on the reader.

- 2 Compare the order of action proposed in Text A and Text B. What does each text suggest should happen first, and what does that difference reveal about each perspective?

- 3 How do the photo essay format and captions in Text C shape its perspective differently from the first-person op-ed in Text B? Use details from both texts.

- 4 Compare how the three texts identify who should act on heat and tree planting. How does each source develop its view of responsibility?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a seven-sentence recommendation to the city council about its tree-planting plan. Compare all three texts, using at least one specific detail from each, and explain how each source's choices could shape the council's view.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

In each text, underline the sentence that most clearly states or implies the source's position. Circle two details, such as an example, image, or word choice, that build that position. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does Text A establish its perspective on tree planting? Identify one priority it names and one language or evidence choice that supports that priority, then explain the effect on the reader.	Text A prioritizes shade near bus stops, playgrounds, and apartment blocks. It uses heat-related information and the question about whether every resident can reach shade, which directs readers to consider access to shade as a city responsibility.
2	Compare the order of action proposed in Text A and Text B. What does each text suggest should happen first, and what does that difference reveal about each perspective?	Text A says trees should be planted first in places where people spend time outdoors. Text B says the city should first repair bus shelters and open cooling centers, then plant trees with protections for sidewalks and a maintenance budget. Text A emphasizes broad access to shade, while Text B emphasizes immediate safety and practical planning.
3	How do the photo essay format and captions in Text C shape its perspective differently from the first-person op-ed in Text B? Use details from both texts.	Text C selects images of students, an older neighbor, and families joining a watering schedule, while its captions use “we” and describe daily walks. These choices present planting as shared neighborhood action. Text B uses a shop owner's first-person account of deliveries, hot doors, and employees to emphasize business and street-use concerns.
4	Compare how the three texts identify who should act on heat and tree planting. How does each source develop its view of responsibility?	Text A places responsibility on the city through statements about what the city should plant and fund. Text B also addresses city leaders, but asks them to protect workers, deliveries, sidewalks, and maintenance before a large rollout. Text C presents students, volunteers, neighbors, and families as people who can act together rather than wait for someone else.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

To the city council, I recommend a planting plan that begins near bus stops, playgrounds, and apartment blocks. Text A builds its position through public-health facts and a question about whether every resident can reach shade. This framing makes the plan seem like a responsibility to protect people during heat. Text B relies on a shop owner's experience with deliveries, hot doors, and employee safety to call for repairs and cooling centers before a large rollout. That firsthand account makes practical limits seem immediate. Text C uses images of students, an older neighbor, and families joining a watering schedule to show shared local action. The council should use A's priority locations, B's maintenance safeguards, and C's volunteer involvement in one plan.

Accept supported interpretations of each perspective when students connect a source choice to its likely effect on readers. For the recommendation, require all three texts, specific passage evidence, comparative analysis, and a clear recommendation.