Garden Plan Detectives

Read a proposal and examine the details that support or challenge it.

4.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the council's proposal. Number three details that support it 1, 2, and 3, then circle the concern that could make someone question the plan.

A Garden Beside the Playground

1. At Pine Ridge School, the student council suggests adding a small native-plant garden beside the playground. The garden would have milkweed, coneflowers, and a bench. Council members say it could give students a calm place to observe insects during recess. They also hope the garden could be used in science lessons about plant life cycles and local habitats.

2. To study the idea, the council surveyed 120 fourth and fifth graders. Eighty-seven students said they would use a garden bench at recess, while 21 said they would rather have more open running space. The principal found an unused strip of grass that is 12 feet wide and 30 feet long. A local nursery offered to donate native plants, which could lower the project cost.

3. Some teachers worry that a garden needs regular care during summer vacation. In response, the council proposes choosing hardy native plants and asking families to sign up for watering weeks. The council concludes that the unused space, the survey results, and the plant donation make the garden a reasonable plan. It asks the school board to approve a one-year trial.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What plan is the student council asking the school board to approve?

2. Choose two details from paragraph 2 that make the garden plan seem practical. Explain how each detail helps the plan.

3. How does paragraph 3 help you evaluate the garden idea instead of only showing its benefits?

4. Does the passage give stronger support for the garden or against it? Use two details to explain your answer.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a different idea that could improve your school. Make a four-part decision note with the idea, two supporting facts, one concern and possible solution, and a conclusion that says whether the school should approve, change, or not approve the idea.

ANSWER KEY

Garden Plan Detectives

GRADE 4 · 4.P.EICC.2.d

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the council's proposal. Number three details that support it 1, 2, and 3, then circle the concern that could make someone question the plan. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What plan is the student council asking the school board to approve?	**A one-year trial of a small native-plant garden beside the playground.**
2	Choose two details from paragraph 2 that make the garden plan seem practical. Explain how each detail helps the plan.	**Possible answers: The unused 12-by-30-foot grass area gives the garden a place to go. The nursery donation could lower the cost. The survey shows that 87 students would use the bench.**
3	How does paragraph 3 help you evaluate the garden idea instead of only showing its benefits?	**It gives a concern about summer care and explains a possible solution, hardy plants and family watering weeks.**
4	Does the passage give stronger support for the garden or against it? Use two details to explain your answer.	**The passage gives stronger support for the garden. Possible details include the 87 students who would use it, the unused space, the plant donation, and the plan for summer watering.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Idea: Put a book-return bin near the bus doors. Support: The library return slot is closed before many bus riders arrive. The librarian records about 35 late books each week from students who ride buses. Concern and solution: Rain could damage books, so place a covered bin inside the entrance. Conclusion: Approve a one-month trial because it may reduce late returns.

Accept reasonable wording when students identify the proposal, supporting evidence, and the care concern. For the open task, accept any school-related idea with two relevant facts, a realistic concern and solution, and a conclusion supported by the details.