Decision Evidence

Trace a claim, its evidence, and what a decision still needs.

5.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's main claim. Circle details that support or limit the claim, and number the details that would help people make a decision.

A Refill Station Idea

1. Our school could add a bottle-refill station near the gym. Students often finish practice thirsty, and the nearest fountain is across the hall. A refill station connects to a fountain and fills reusable bottles. It can also have a counter that shows how many plastic bottles the station may have helped replace. This feature makes a daily choice visible.

2. I think the station could help our school use fewer single-use bottles. In a lunchtime tally last week, 18 of 30 students who walked past the gym carried reusable bottles. This suggests that many students could use a refill station. However, the tally was brief and taken in only one place, so it cannot tell us how many students would refill bottles each day.

3. Before deciding, the student council should compare the station's price with the cost of keeping it working. The council should also ask the custodian whether the gym fountain has the needed plumbing. A two-week count of students who bring reusable bottles could give stronger evidence. These details would help the principal decide whether the idea is practical for the school, not just popular.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What is the writer's main claim about the bottle-refill station?

2. What evidence does the writer use to support the claim, and what does the writer say it suggests?

3. Why does the writer say the lunchtime tally is not enough evidence? Give two reasons.

4. Name two kinds of information the student council should use to decide whether the station is practical.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a different idea for improving your school. Create a four-part decision box with a proposal, two kinds of evidence to gather, one limitation of the evidence, and one decision question.

ANSWER KEY

Decision Evidence

GRADE 5 · 5.P.EICC.2.d

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's main claim. Circle details that support or limit the claim, and number the details that would help people make a decision. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's main claim about the bottle-refill station?	**The station could help the school use fewer single-use bottles.**
2	What evidence does the writer use to support the claim, and what does the writer say it suggests?	**A lunchtime tally found that 18 of 30 students near the gym carried reusable bottles. It suggests that many students could use a refill station.**
3	Why does the writer say the lunchtime tally is not enough evidence? Give two reasons.	**It was brief and taken in only one place, so it cannot show how many students would refill bottles each day.**
4	Name two kinds of information the student council should use to decide whether the station is practical.	**The council should compare the station's price with its upkeep cost and check whether the gym fountain has the needed plumbing.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Proposal: Add a covered bike rack. Evidence to gather: Count bicycles left outside during a rainy week, and ask students who bike whether rain keeps them from riding. Limitation: One week may not represent all weather. Decision question: Does the school have a safe, affordable place for the rack?

Accept answers that accurately identify the claim, relevant evidence, and the limits of the tally. For the open task, accept a clear decision aid with all four requested parts and evidence that fits the proposed idea.