Test the Proposal

Trace how a school proposal uses evidence, limits, and a trial plan.

6.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main recommendation, circle the evidence that supports it, and put a star beside each detail that shows the writer considered a concern or limit. These marks will help you judge whether the proposal is supported and realistic.

A Share Table for Lunch

1 At Riverbend Middle School, the cafeteria sends sealed fruit cups, packaged crackers, and unopened cereal bars to the trash after lunch. Our school should set up a share table where students can place safe, unopened food for others to take. This change could reduce waste and help students who are still hungry. It would not replace the regular lunch program. Instead, it would give food a second chance to be eaten before custodians collect the trash from bins.

2 Some people may worry that a share table would be messy or unsafe. The table would accept only unopened, commercially packaged items, and a staff member could check it at the end of each lunch period. In a five-day student council count last April, students threw away 126 unopened food items. That count does not prove every item would be taken, but it shows that edible food is being discarded. Clear rules and a labeled table could make the system manageable.

3 A share table also gives students a way to help run a practical project. Student volunteers could make a poster that explains which foods belong on the table, while adults handle safety checks. The principal could test the idea for one month and compare the number of unopened items in the trash before and during the trial. If few students use the table, the school could revise the plan or stop it. A short trial is a sensible first step for Riverbend.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What action does the writer recommend, and what sentence shows that the writer is defining the limits of that recommendation?

2. How does the count of 126 unopened food items support the writer's proposal? What limit does the writer place on this evidence?

3. Which two details respond to the concern that the share table could be unsafe? Explain how they strengthen the proposal.

4. What would the principal compare during the one-month trial? Why does the possibility of revising or stopping the plan make the proposal stronger?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a different idea to improve your school. Create a three-row chart labeled Claim, Evidence, and Question or Limitation, then write two sentences evaluating whether the evidence supports the claim and what information is still needed.

CATEGORY	YOUR RESPONSE

ANSWER KEY

Test the Proposal

GRADE 6 · 6.P.EICC.2.d

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main recommendation, circle the evidence that supports it, and put a star beside each detail that shows the writer considered a concern or limit. These marks will help you judge whether the proposal is supported and realistic. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What action does the writer recommend, and what sentence shows that the writer is defining the limits of that recommendation?	**The writer recommends setting up a share table for safe, unopened food. The limit is shown by the sentence, "It would not replace the regular lunch program."**
2	How does the count of 126 unopened food items support the writer's proposal? What limit does the writer place on this evidence?	**The count shows that edible food is being thrown away, so a share table could reduce waste. The writer says the count does not prove that every item would be taken.**
3	Which two details respond to the concern that the share table could be unsafe? Explain how they strengthen the proposal.	**Only unopened, commercially packaged items would be accepted, and a staff member could check the table after each lunch period. These details provide safety rules and adult oversight.**
4	What would the principal compare during the one-month trial? Why does the possibility of revising or stopping the plan make the proposal stronger?	**The principal would compare the number of unopened items in the trash before and during the trial. Revising or stopping the plan shows that the writer wants to use results to judge whether the idea works.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Claim: The school should add a water bottle refill station near the gym. Evidence: During one week, staff counted 84 empty plastic water bottles in the gym trash. Question or Limitation: The school needs to know the station's cost and how many students would use it. The bottle count supports trying a refill station because it shows that students use bottled water near the gym. The school should compare the station's cost with the possible reduction in bottles before deciding.

Accept claims, evidence, and limitations that fit together logically. The evaluation should state how the evidence supports or fails to support the claim and identify a relevant piece of missing information.