Garden Claim Check

Analyze how evidence can support, question, and extend an idea.

6.T.RA.1.c "Draw from accumulated knowledge and research to analyze texts, supporting, challenging, or extending ideas and information. (C)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the city leaders' claim, circle the evidence that would support it, and number two details that show why more research is needed. These marks help you see how evidence can support an idea while leaving questions to investigate.

Can City Gardens Help Monarchs?

(1) Some city leaders say that planting pollinator gardens in vacant lots can help monarch butterflies. Monarch caterpillars eat only milkweed leaves, while adult butterflies drink nectar from many flowers. Consider a proposed study in Minneapolis. Volunteers would change several empty lots into gardens with milkweed and native flowers. If they found more monarch eggs and caterpillars there than in nearby grass lots during the next two summers, the result would support the leaders' idea. Yet that comparison alone would not prove that gardens caused the increase.

(2) However, the comparison has limits. The garden lots may have received more sunlight, water, or attention from volunteers than the grass lots. Scientists would also want to count butterflies in the same places before gardens were planted. A larger study could include many neighborhoods and use the same counting method at each site. Research on monarch migration adds another idea: weather conditions far from Minneapolis can affect how many monarchs arrive there. Therefore, local gardens may help, while other causes may also change the number of monarchs seen.

(3) One research report from the Xerces Society explains that monarch populations are affected by habitat loss across their migration route. The report recommends planting regionally native milkweed and nectar plants, not just any flowers. This information extends the city leaders' proposal. A garden plan could include native plants and places for people to report egg and caterpillar counts each week. Comparing those counts with weather records could help researchers decide whether gardens, weather, or both influenced the results. The proposal is promising, but careful evidence is still needed.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What result in the proposed Minneapolis study would support the city leaders' claim? Explain how it supports the claim.

2. Name one detail that challenges the idea that gardens alone caused an increase in monarchs.

3. How does the Xerces Society information extend the city leaders' proposal?

4. Describe one research step from the passage that would make the garden study stronger. Why would that step help?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a claim about a project at your school or in your neighborhood. Write 4 sentences that state the claim, use one observation or fact you already know and one fact from a reliable source, and include a question or condition that could challenge or extend the claim. Name your source.

ANSWER KEY

Garden Claim Check

GRADE 6 · 6.T.RA.1.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the city leaders' claim, circle the evidence that would support it, and number two details that show why more research is needed. These marks help you see how evidence can support an idea while leaving questions to investigate. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What result in the proposed Minneapolis study would support the city leaders' claim? Explain how it supports the claim.	**Finding more monarch eggs and caterpillars in the garden lots than in nearby grass lots would support the claim because it suggests the gardens help monarchs.**
2	Name one detail that challenges the idea that gardens alone caused an increase in monarchs.	**Garden lots may have had more sunlight, water, or volunteer attention than grass lots, so another factor could have affected the results.**
3	How does the Xerces Society information extend the city leaders' proposal?	**It suggests that gardens should use regionally native milkweed and nectar plants, not just any flowers.**
4	Describe one research step from the passage that would make the garden study stronger. Why would that step help?	**Count butterflies in the same places before gardens are planted. This gives researchers a before-and-after comparison.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should add a shaded outdoor reading area near the library. At lunch, I have noticed that students avoid the sunny benches on hot days. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency explains that shade can reduce exposure to ultraviolet radiation. Before choosing a location, the school should ask students where shade is needed and check whether trees or a canopy would be safe and affordable.

Accept equivalent evidence-based explanations for Questions 1 through 4 when they use passage details. For Part 3, accept varied claims if the response includes a relevant prior observation or fact, a named reliable source, and a question or condition that tests, challenges, or extends the claim.