

The Refill Case

Trace how a school proposal builds its case.

7.T.T.3.a “Analyze argumentative techniques used to present and design content, including an author’s claim, supporting relevant evidence, an identified counterclaim, and a conclusion that logically follows the argument. (I)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the author’s claim and conclusion, circle each piece of supporting evidence, and label the counterclaim 1 and its response 2. These marks show how the argument is built.

A Better Place to Refill

- ① Students at Cedar Ridge Middle School should add two water-bottle refill stations near the gym and art rooms. The building has one station by the cafeteria, so students in those wings often walk across the school to refill bottles. Last week, the Eco Club counted 46 students using disposable bottles after physical education. Refill stations would give students a nearby option and could reduce plastic bottles in classroom trash. They would also help students refill bottles quickly between classes instead of arriving late.
- ② Some people may argue that the school should spend its money on classroom supplies, not new stations. That concern matters because a refill station costs money to buy and install. However, the principal could ask the parent group and local businesses to help fund the stations, as they did for the new library stools last spring. The school could also choose durable models with filters that can be changed, protecting the investment over time. These steps address cost without ignoring students’ need for water.
- ③ Adding refill stations is a practical change that would make the school day easier and create less plastic waste. The proposal does not claim that stations will solve every environmental problem. Instead, it offers a specific improvement supported by the bottle count, the long walk from busy wings, and a plan for handling costs. For these reasons, Cedar Ridge should place two refill stations near the gym and art rooms before the next school year begins. Students, staff, and visitors could all use them.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 What is the author's main claim?

2 Name two pieces of relevant evidence the author uses to support the claim.

3 What counterclaim does the author identify, and how does the author respond to it?

4 How does the conclusion logically follow the argument?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a four-sentence argument for one improvement at your school. Include a claim, one relevant detail from your experience or a source, a counterclaim with a response, and a conclusion that follows from your reasons.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the author's claim and conclusion, circle each piece of supporting evidence, and label the counterclaim 1 and its response 2. These marks show how the argument is built. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the author's main claim?	Cedar Ridge Middle School should add two water-bottle refill stations near the gym and art rooms.
2	Name two pieces of relevant evidence the author uses to support the claim.	The school has only one refill station by the cafeteria, so students in the gym and art wings walk across the school. The Eco Club counted 46 students using disposable bottles after physical education.
3	What counterclaim does the author identify, and how does the author respond to it?	The counterclaim is that the school should spend money on classroom supplies instead of stations. The author responds that the parent group and local businesses could help pay, and the school could choose durable stations with replaceable filters.
4	How does the conclusion logically follow the argument?	It repeats the recommendation to add two stations and bases it on the evidence about disposable bottles, long walks to refill, and a plan to handle costs.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should add a covered bike rack near the main entrance. On rainy days, students who bike must leave wet bicycles in the uncovered rack, which can make seats and supplies damp. Some people may say a covered rack would take too much space, but it could be built beside the current rack. Therefore, a covered rack would make biking to school more practical.

Accept equivalent wording for the claim, evidence, counterclaim, response, and conclusion. For the open task, accept reasonable school-improvement ideas when all four required argument parts are present and the conclusion matches the reasons.