

Sunday Library Debate

Trace how three text types shape views on one community decision.

8.T.C.2.a “Compare and contrast varying perspectives on a particular topic found across a variety of texts, analyzing how texts establish and develop perspective to shape perceptions or beliefs. (I)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each text's main position. Circle two words or details in each paragraph that show how the writer tries to shape your view, then number the three positions 1, 2, and 3.

Should the Library Open on Sundays?

- ① In a student newspaper editorial, Maya Ortiz argues that the town should keep its public library open on Sundays. She begins with a scene of families waiting outside after weekend sports games, then describes students who lack quiet internet access at home. Ortiz admits that staffing costs matter, but she says volunteers cannot replace trained librarians. Her word choices, including “doorway” and “lifeline,” present the library as an essential community service. She ends by asking readers to picture a week without free books, computers, or help.
- ② By contrast, a budget memo from City Manager Daniel Reed recommends closing the library on Sundays for one year. Reed opens with numbers: Sunday operations cost \$48,000 last year, while average Sunday attendance was 112 visitors. He explains that the money could restore weekday hours at two branch libraries. Rather than describing individual patrons, the memo uses charts, totals, and the phrase “responsible use of limited funds.” Reed frames the decision as a temporary test, promising that the council will review attendance and costs after six months.
- ③ A neighborhood association flyer offers a third view: keep the library open on two Sundays each month. The flyer quotes a parent who relies on the library during school breaks and reports that 63 percent of survey respondents favored some Sunday service. It also notes Reed's cost concern, suggesting shorter hours and local business donations. Its heading, “Open Doors, Wise Spending,” joins the values of access and budgeting. Unlike Ortiz's urgent appeal or Reed's financial focus, the flyer builds support by presenting a compromise as practical and fair.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 What position does Ortiz take, and how do her opening scene and word choices develop that position?

2 What position does Reed take? Explain how the memo's numbers and its description of a temporary test shape the reader's perception of his plan.

3 Compare Ortiz's and Reed's evidence. How does each writer's choice of evidence encourage readers to think differently about Sunday library hours?

4 How does the flyer respond to both Ortiz's and Reed's perspectives, and what does it do to make its compromise seem reasonable?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a three-sentence social media post from a local business owner who supports one of the Sunday library plans. State a clear perspective, use one fact or detail from the passage, and use a persuasive word choice or brief example to shape readers' views.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline each text's main position. Circle two words or details in each paragraph that show how the writer tries to shape your view, then number the three positions 1, 2, and 3. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What position does Ortiz take, and how do her opening scene and word choices develop that position?	Ortiz supports full Sunday library hours. Her scene of families and students shows people who need the library, and words such as "doorway" and "lifeline" make it seem essential.
2	What position does Reed take? Explain how the memo's numbers and its description of a temporary test shape the reader's perception of his plan.	Reed supports closing on Sundays for one year. The cost and attendance numbers make closure seem financially responsible, while calling it a temporary test makes the plan seem less permanent.
3	Compare Ortiz's and Reed's evidence. How does each writer's choice of evidence encourage readers to think differently about Sunday library hours?	Ortiz uses examples of individual patrons and emotional language to stress community need. Reed uses costs, attendance, and budget language to stress careful spending.
4	How does the flyer respond to both Ortiz's and Reed's perspectives, and what does it do to make its compromise seem reasonable?	The flyer recognizes Ortiz's concern about access and Reed's concern about costs. It uses a parent quote, survey result, shorter hours, and donations to present two Sundays a month as a practical compromise.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

As a bookstore owner, I support opening the library on two Sundays each month. The 63 percent survey result shows that many residents want some weekend service, and shorter hours could limit costs. This balanced plan keeps a welcoming doorway open for families while respecting the city's budget.

Accept responses that accurately identify each perspective and connect specific evidence, language, or text structure to the perception it creates. For the open task, accept any supported position that uses a passage detail and a deliberate persuasive technique in exactly three sentences.