

Evidence Under Cover

Analyze how a proposal earns a careful decision.

9.P.EICC.2.d "Interpret and construct texts to aid the analysis and evaluation of texts and ideas. (I/C)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the proposal's claim and two pieces of evidence. Circle one limitation or uncertainty, and number the sentence that answers a competing concern, so you can judge how well the proposal supports its request.

The Case for a Covered Walkway

- ① At Northgate High, students cross an open stretch of pavement between the bus loop and the main entrance. During rain, the path becomes crowded as students share a few umbrellas or wait beside the buses. The Student Transit Committee proposes a covered walkway along this route. Its main claim is practical: shelter would make arrival safer and more predictable, especially for students who ride the bus. The committee does not argue that a roof will solve every arrival problem. Instead, it presents the walkway as one improvement that could reduce a daily obstacle.
- ② To support the proposal, the committee combines local observations with cost information. In a two-week count, members recorded 146 students waiting in the open during rainy morning arrivals. A survey of 210 bus riders found that 68 percent had arrived with wet notebooks or clothing at least once that semester. The committee also obtained an estimate of \$38,000 from a licensed contractor. These details make the need visible, but they have limits. The count covered only two rainy weeks, and the survey reports students' experiences rather than measuring injuries or lost class time.
- ③ Some readers may question whether the money should go to classroom materials instead. The committee addresses this concern by suggesting that the school seek a small district facilities grant and schedule construction during summer break. This response does not prove that funding will be available, but it shows that the committee has considered a competing priority. The proposal ends by asking the principal to authorize a formal bid process, not to promise immediate construction. That limited request matches the evidence: before choosing a project, the school needs firmer prices, accessibility review, and a comparison with other safety needs.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the committee's main claim, and what change does it want the school to consider?

2 Identify two details the committee uses as evidence that students need shelter on the route.

3 How do the limits of the count and survey affect your evaluation of the proposal's evidence?

4 Why does the committee ask for a formal bid process instead of immediate construction?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Your school is considering converting a storage room into a quiet study room. Write a 90 to 120 word recommendation to the principal using these details: all 24 library study seats were full during 31 of 40 lunch periods, 102 of 160 students said noise makes independent work difficult, conversion may cost \$12,000, and the robotics team uses the storage room twice each week. Make a claim, use two details as evidence, address one limitation or competing priority, and make a request that fits the evidence.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the proposal's claim and two pieces of evidence. Circle one limitation or uncertainty, and number the sentence that answers a competing concern, so you can judge how well the proposal supports its request. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the committee's main claim, and what change does it want the school to consider?	The committee claims that a covered walkway could make bus arrival safer and more predictable, and it wants the school to consider building one.
2	Identify two details the committee uses as evidence that students need shelter on the route.	It recorded 146 students waiting in the open during rainy arrivals, and 68 percent of 210 bus riders reported arriving with wet notebooks or clothing.
3	How do the limits of the count and survey affect your evaluation of the proposal's evidence?	The evidence shows that rain creates a problem, but it is limited because the count covered only two rainy weeks and the survey does not measure injuries or lost class time.
4	Why does the committee ask for a formal bid process instead of immediate construction?	The committee needs firmer prices, an accessibility review, and a comparison with other safety needs before the school makes a final decision.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend that the school examine converting the storage room into a quiet study room. The library log shows that all 24 study seats were full during 31 of 40 lunch periods, and 102 of 160 students said noise makes independent work difficult. These figures suggest a real need for another calm workspace. However, the robotics team uses the room twice each week, and conversion is estimated at \$12,000. The principal should first request a detailed plan that identifies another robotics location and confirms renovation costs before approving the change.

Accept equivalent statements that accurately connect the claim, evidence, limitations, and requested action. For the open response, accept varied recommendations if they use at least two scenario details, address the robotics team or cost, and make a suitably limited request.