

Draft Under Review

Use goals and feedback to judge a revised proposal.

9.P.EICC.4.f “Evaluate the text’s effectiveness based on self-review or feedback from others, determining whether the text matches the purpose and goals for writing. (C)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline Maya’s purpose and goals, circle each piece of feedback or self-review, and number the revisions that help her meet those goals.

A Proposal Gets Stronger

- ① For student council, Maya drafted a proposal asking the principal to add a covered bicycle rack near the gym. Her purpose was to persuade the principal to approve the project before spring rain began. She set three goals: explain why riders needed shelter, show that the plan was affordable, and request a clear next step. Her first draft described soaked backpacks and rusty bike chains, but it gave no price or location. Maya reread it and noticed that a principal could not judge whether the idea would fit the campus budget or space. She wrote in her review notes, “My examples are vivid, but my evidence does not support approval.”
- ② At a peer-review meeting, Jordan said the proposal’s opening made the problem easy to picture. He also asked where the rack would go and how much it would cost. A science teacher suggested adding the number of students who bike to school, because one rider’s experience might not represent the need. Maya checked a lunchtime bike count conducted by the environmental club. It recorded 38 bicycles on a clear Tuesday. She added that number, proposed the unused pavement beside the gym doors, and included a \$2,400 estimate from a local rack supplier. These changes gave the principal information needed to compare the request with available space and money.
- ③ Before sending the revision, Maya used her goals as a checklist. The new version explained the need with a student count, addressed cost and location, and ended by asking the principal to place the proposal on the next facilities agenda. However, Maya decided not to add a claim that covered racks would increase attendance. She could not find reliable evidence for that claim, and it was not necessary for her request. She concluded that the revised proposal now matched its purpose because it combined a specific problem with practical details and a realistic action. She planned to ask the principal one final question: whether the estimate fit the school’s funds.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What was Maya's purpose, and what three goals did she set for her proposal?

2 Which feedback led Maya to add numerical evidence, and what evidence did she add?

3 What two revisions gave the principal the clearest information about whether the project was practical? Explain why.

4 Does Maya's revised proposal match her purpose and goals? Use two details from the passage to support your judgment.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose a draft you have written, or imagine a short proposal, email, or article. Write exactly four sentences: state its purpose and one goal, give one specific self-review or feedback point, name a revision, and judge whether the revision helps the text meet its purpose.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline Maya's purpose and goals, circle each piece of feedback or self-review, and number the revisions that help her meet those goals. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What was Maya's purpose, and what three goals did she set for her proposal?	Her purpose was to persuade the principal to approve a covered bicycle rack. Her goals were to explain the need for shelter, show affordability, and request a clear next step.
2	Which feedback led Maya to add numerical evidence, and what evidence did she add?	The science teacher said that one rider's experience might not represent the need. Maya added the environmental club's count of 38 bicycles.
3	What two revisions gave the principal the clearest information about whether the project was practical? Explain why.	Maya added a location beside the gym doors and a \$2,400 estimate. These details let the principal consider available space and money.
4	Does Maya's revised proposal match her purpose and goals? Use two details from the passage to support your judgment.	Yes. It uses a student bike count to show need and includes cost and location details. It also asks the principal to place the proposal on the facilities agenda.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

My email asks the librarian to extend library hours during exam week, and its goal is to show that students need a quiet study space. A classmate said my draft explained the problem but gave no evidence that students would use the extra time. I will add results from a survey in which 46 students said they would stay after school. This revision makes the request more convincing because it gives the librarian information for deciding whether later hours are worthwhile.

Accept equivalent statements of Maya's purpose, goals, feedback, and revisions when they are supported by the passage. For the open task, accept varied topics if the response has exactly four sentences and clearly connects feedback or self-review to a revision and an effectiveness judgment.