

Shade the Argument

Analyze choices in a city council speech.

9.T.T.3 "Argumentative Techniques: Evaluate and apply argumentative techniques to enhance text's appeal to audiences or achieve specific purposes."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim and proposed action, circle the evidence, and number the counterclaim 1 and its response 2 to see how the writer builds support for the council.

A Cooler Wait for Riders

- ① Members of the Riverton City Council, our bus stops need shade. On August afternoons, riders wait on bare sidewalks while pavement radiates heat. Who should have to choose between arriving at work on time and standing in unsafe heat? Installing shade structures at the ten busiest stops would protect students, older adults, and workers. This is not a luxury. It is a practical public service that helps every rider reach school, jobs, appointments, and home safely. It also gives parents more confidence when their teenagers travel independently after classes or practice.
- ② Some residents may worry shelters cost too much or make sidewalks crowded. Those concerns deserve attention, yet the city can begin with stops serving the most riders and use designs sized for each location. In hot weather, shade can reduce a person's exposure to direct sunlight, and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention advises people to seek shade during extreme heat. Older adults, children, and people with certain health conditions are more vulnerable to heat-related illness. When people cannot use transit, they may miss shifts, medical visits, or classes. These facts give the council a clear reason to act before next summer.
- ③ Shade structures are not the only answer to summer heat, and they will require planning. Still, waiting does not solve the problem for a student carrying a backpack at 3:30 or a nurse returning from an overnight shift. Council members can approve a pilot program this fall, track ridership and rider feedback, and publish the costs. If the pilot works, Riverton can expand it responsibly. Let us make transit a choice people can use even on the hottest days, rather than a service they must avoid.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the writer's main claim in paragraph 1? Use a phrase from the passage in your answer.

2 Which evidence in paragraph 2 supports the need for shade, and why might this evidence persuade city council members?

3 How does the writer respond to the concern that shelters may cost too much or crowd sidewalks?

4 What action does the writer ask council members to take in paragraph 3? How does this proposal make the argument more convincing?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write a 90-110 word email to your principal supporting a water refill station near the gym. Include a claim, the evidence that a student council tally found 43 plastic bottles in nearby trash bins after one home game, a counterclaim and response, a rhetorical question, and a clear action request.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim and proposed action, circle the evidence, and number the counterclaim 1 and its response 2 to see how the writer builds support for the council. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's main claim in paragraph 1? Use a phrase from the passage in your answer.	The writer claims that Riverton's bus stops need shade, especially at the ten busiest stops.
2	Which evidence in paragraph 2 supports the need for shade, and why might this evidence persuade city council members?	The writer cites CDC guidance to seek shade during extreme heat and notes that older adults, children, and people with certain health conditions are more vulnerable. This uses a trusted source and connects shade to public health.
3	How does the writer respond to the concern that shelters may cost too much or crowd sidewalks?	The writer acknowledges the concern, then proposes starting at the busiest stops and using designs sized for each location.
4	What action does the writer ask council members to take in paragraph 3? How does this proposal make the argument more convincing?	The writer asks the council to approve a pilot program, track ridership and feedback, and publish costs. A pilot makes the plan seem careful, measurable, and easier to expand responsibly.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Principal Chen, our school should install a water refill station near the gym. After one home game, the student council counted 43 plastic bottles in nearby trash bins. Why keep sending so many bottles to the landfill when athletes and families could refill reusable ones? A station would make water easier to get and reduce waste. Some people may say installation costs are too high. However, the school could seek a local business sponsor and compare that cost with ongoing bottle purchases. Please ask the facilities committee to price a station and report its findings next month.

Accept equivalent descriptions of the claim, evidence, counterclaim, response, and pilot proposal when they are supported by the passage. For Part 3, accept varied positions and wording if the response meets the word count and includes every required argumentative technique.