

Protecting the Past

Trace how a model argument connects a claim, a counterclaim, and evidence.

L6-8WHST1.c "Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the claim and the counterclaim, circle words or phrases that connect ideas, and number each piece of supporting evidence.

Should Mesa Verde Be Preserved?

- ① Some people argue that the United States should continue to fund the preservation of Mesa Verde National Park in Colorado. Their claim rests on the park's cliff dwellings, which were built by Ancestral Pueblo people more than 700 years ago. Because these structures connect visitors to a real past, protecting them helps people study history beyond a textbook. For example, archaeologists examine building materials and everyday objects to learn how communities lived. Therefore, preservation supports both historical research and public learning.
- ② However, others question spending public money on the park. They may counter that repairs, visitor centers, and staff cost money that could support current needs, such as schools or roads. This concern matters because government budgets are limited. Yet delaying all preservation can create a larger problem: wind, rain, and freezing temperatures can damage ancient walls over time. If damage becomes severe, repairs may cost more, and important evidence about the past may be lost. Thus, the counterclaim recognizes a real choice, while the evidence explains the risk of waiting.
- ③ Consequently, a balanced plan can answer both sides. The National Park Service can protect the most fragile dwellings first, while setting a clear budget for other needs. In addition, visitors can follow rules that reduce harm, including staying on paths and not touching walls. These steps do not remove the cost concern. Instead, they show that careful choices can limit costs and prevent damage. For these reasons, continued preservation is the stronger position, since once an irreplaceable site is harmed, later generations cannot study it in the same way.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the claim in paragraph 1, and which phrase introduces an example that supports it?

2 How does the word “However” at the beginning of paragraph 2 clarify the relationship between paragraphs 1 and 2?

3 What evidence follows the word “Yet,” and how does that evidence respond to the counterclaim?

4 What does “Consequently” signal about the relationship between paragraph 3 and the earlier paragraphs?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write four sentences about whether a community should preserve a historic place. State a claim, add a counterclaim, give one reason or piece of evidence, and use at least three linking words or phrases to show how your ideas connect.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the claim and the counterclaim, circle words or phrases that connect ideas, and number each piece of supporting evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the claim in paragraph 1, and which phrase introduces an example that supports it?	The claim is that the United States should continue to fund preservation of Mesa Verde National Park. "For example" introduces supporting evidence.
2	How does the word "However" at the beginning of paragraph 2 clarify the relationship between paragraphs 1 and 2?	It signals a contrast and introduces the counterclaim against spending public money on the park.
3	What evidence follows the word "Yet," and how does that evidence respond to the counterclaim?	Wind, rain, and freezing temperatures can damage ancient walls, and severe damage can cost more to repair or cause evidence to be lost. This shows that delaying preservation may create bigger costs and losses.
4	What does "Consequently" signal about the relationship between paragraph 3 and the earlier paragraphs?	It signals that paragraph 3 gives a result or response to the claim and counterclaim, a balanced preservation plan.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A community should preserve its historic train station because the building can teach residents about local travel and trade. However, some residents may argue that repairs would cost too much. For example, the station's old ticket window and platform can help students examine how passengers traveled before cars became common. Therefore, the community should set a budget for repairs while keeping the site open for learning.

Accept varied claims and topics if the response includes a clear claim, counterclaim, reason or evidence, and at least three accurate linking words or phrases. Linking language should make relationships such as contrast, cause, example, or conclusion clear.