Beyond the Vote

Trace how a council weighs a compromise without erasing dissent.

11-12.CC.4 "Conduct, debate, and discuss to allow all views to be presented; allow for a dissenting view, in addition to group compromise; and determine what additional information or research is required to deepen the investigation or complete the..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read the council discussion. Underline each concern that changes the proposal, circle the unresolved objection, and number two kinds of information the council still needs.

How Late Should the Library Stay Open?

1. At a student council meeting, Maya proposed keeping the school library open until 5:00 p.m. on weekdays. "Last Tuesday, I counted 28 students still working when the doors closed at 3:30," she said. "A quiet place to study should not vanish just when students are settling in." Luis asked whether one Tuesday could represent the whole week. He wanted to hear from students who leave right away for jobs or family duties. The chair, Noor, repeated both points before inviting others in: the count showed demand that day, but the group did not yet know how often it happened.

2. Priya, who helps at the library, said an extra hour would require an adult supervisor; the council had not checked staffing costs. Devon pointed out that the late bus leaves at 4:15 on Tuesdays and Thursdays only. "If we build this plan around students who can get a ride home, whose need are we meeting?" he asked. Maya acknowledged the concern rather than repeating her opening speech. She suggested a six-week trial on Tuesdays and Thursdays, with the library closing at 4:05 so riders could reach the late bus. Noor asked the group to record both the proposed trial and the reasons behind it.

3. Luis supported the trial but asked for attendance counts on every trial day, not just one busy afternoon. Priya proposed asking the librarian how supervision could work before the council sent its request to the principal. Devon still dissented: students whose caregivers work late might need access on other days, and a Tuesday-Thursday trial would miss them. Noor did not call the proposal unanimous. Instead, she said the council could present the trial as a provisional compromise, attach Devon's objection, and ask students about transportation and work schedules. The group would revisit the plan after collecting those answers.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does Noor make room for different views before and after the trial is proposed? Give two actions from the passage.

2. What concern does Devon's question about rides home emphasize, and how does Maya change her proposal in response?

3. Why does Devon still dissent after the group considers the trial? Explain what the compromise does not address.

4. Name two kinds of information the council plans to gather. How would each help the group decide what to do next?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A school is considering replacing one of its two walk-up lunch lines with a preorder-only pickup line. Write a six-sentence council summary that fairly presents a reason for faster pickup and a concern about access, proposes a compromise, preserves one unresolved objection, and names two facts to investigate before a final decision.

Beyond the Vote

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read the council discussion. Underline each concern that changes the proposal, circle the unresolved objection, and number two kinds of information the council still needs. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does Noor make room for different views before and after the trial is proposed? Give two actions from the passage.	**She repeats Maya's and Luis's points before inviting others to speak. Later, she asks the group to record the trial's reasons and include Devon's objection rather than call the proposal unanimous.**
2	What concern does Devon's question about rides home emphasize, and how does Maya change her proposal in response?	**His question emphasizes that a plan may exclude students without rides. Maya changes her weekday, 5:00 p.m. proposal to a Tuesday-Thursday trial ending at 4:05, before the late bus.**
3	Why does Devon still dissent after the group considers the trial? Explain what the compromise does not address.	**The trial covers only Tuesdays and Thursdays, so it does not address students who need library access on other days because their caregivers work late.**
4	Name two kinds of information the council plans to gather. How would each help the group decide what to do next?	**Attendance counts across trial days would show whether students use the longer hours. Information about supervision would show whether staffing is feasible. Accept transportation and work-schedule information as another way to assess whose needs the trial misses.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Students who preorder say a pickup line could shorten their wait, especially when the lunch period is nearly over. Others say they cannot always preorder, so losing a walk-up line could leave them with fewer choices. I would suggest testing a pickup station beside both existing walk-up lines for two weeks rather than replacing either line. One student still objects that even a trial might pull cafeteria workers away from the regular lines. Before deciding, we should measure how long students wait in each line during the trial. We should also ask cafeteria staff whether they can run the station without slowing walk-up service.

Accept equivalent evidence-based explanations and other relevant information the council explicitly proposes gathering. For the open response, look for six sentences that distinguish the compromise from the objection it leaves unresolved.