Which Side Advances?

Sort the moves in an argument about AI use in writing.

11-12.W.1.a "Introduce precise claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence."

NAME _____ DATE _____

ADVANCES THE CLAIM

This move strengthens the writer's position by giving a reason it matters or a benefit it could bring.

Protecting urban wetlands would reduce flooding in nearby neighborhoods.

RAISES A COUNTERCLAIM

This move presents an objection or a different solution that challenges the writer's position. A strong argument considers this view before responding to it.

Critics argue that protecting urban wetlands would block much-needed housing.

1 SORT

8 items

A writer argues that districts should require students to disclose AI use in graded essays so teachers can judge original thinking; circle SUPPORT or OPPOSE for each item, then choose two items and explain how each relates to the writer's position.

1.	Requiring disclosure lets teachers tell when a polished essay reflects a student's own analysis.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
2.	A brief AI-use note would help teachers give fairer feedback on drafting skills.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
3.	Mandatory disclosure could unfairly stigmatize students who use AI only to check grammar.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
4.	Knowing which ideas came from AI would help teachers target lessons on source evaluation.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
5.	A better policy would assess students' thinking through in-class drafts rather than require AI-use reports.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
6.	Because AI assistance is hard to verify, a disclosure rule might reward honest students while leaving dishonest use hidden.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
7.	Uniform disclosure expectations would make grading standards clearer across classes.	SUPPORT OPPOSE
8.	Disclosure would let teachers distinguish a student's revisions from suggestions produced by a chatbot.	SUPPORT OPPOSE

2 PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Pick two items from Part 1. For each one, tell how you knew where it belonged.

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

3 MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Write one new sentence that supports the writer's position and one new sentence that raises a counterclaim.

SUPPORT _____

OPPOSE _____

CHALLENGE

Choose one SUPPORT item and one OPPOSE item from Part 1, then write four sentences in this order: state the claim and why it matters, propose specific evidence that could be gathered, present the counterclaim fairly, and respond to it.

ANSWER KEY

Which Side Advances?

PART 1 · SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	Requiring disclosure lets teachers tell when a polished essay reflects a student's own analysis.	**SUPPORT**	Connects disclosure to evaluating independent reasoning.
2	A brief AI-use note would help teachers give fairer feedback on drafting skills.	**SUPPORT**	Names a benefit of the proposed requirement.
3	Mandatory disclosure could unfairly stigmatize students who use AI only to check grammar.	**OPPOSE**	Raises a possible harm caused by the requirement.
4	Knowing which ideas came from AI would help teachers target lessons on source evaluation.	**SUPPORT**	Gives another educational benefit of disclosure.
5	A better policy would assess students' thinking through in-class drafts rather than require AI-use reports.	**OPPOSE**	Proposes an alternative to the writer's policy.
6	Because AI assistance is hard to verify, a disclosure rule might reward honest students while leaving dishonest use hidden.	**OPPOSE**	Questions whether the requirement would work fairly.
7	Uniform disclosure expectations would make grading standards clearer across classes.	**SUPPORT**	States a benefit of adopting the requirement districtwide.
8	Disclosure would let teachers distinguish a student's revisions from suggestions produced by a chatbot.	**SUPPORT**	Explains how disclosure could clarify authorship.

PART 2 · PROVE IT

Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 · MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **SUPPORT**: An AI-use statement could help teachers identify students who need more practice developing their own thesis statements.
- **OPPOSE**: Instead of requiring AI-use statements, districts could ask students to submit annotated outlines that show how their ideas developed.

Challenge: Districts should require AI-use disclosure in graded essays because teachers need to know whether an essay shows a student's own reasoning. To test this benefit, a district could compare teachers' feedback on drafts with and without AI-use notes to see whether the notes help them identify gaps in reasoning. Critics argue that disclosure could unfairly stigmatize students who use AI only to check grammar. Asking students to specify the kind of help they received would separate grammar checks from generated analysis while giving teachers information for useful feedback.

For Part 2, look for explanations tied to the stated position, not just a restatement of an item. In the challenge, the sample uses items 1 and 3; students may choose other pairs if their four sentences follow the requested sequence.