Refill the Argument

Read a model argument and examine how its choices support a claim.

11-12.W.1.b "Use rhetorical strategies to enhance the effectiveness of the claim."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim, circle two vivid scenes or comparisons, and number an objection and its response. Use your marks to consider how these choices make the claim more persuasive.

Water for the Whole Game

(1) At the final whistle, students stream from the bleachers with empty plastic bottles in their hands. Some find a recycling bin; others find only a trash can already spilling over. Our school should install water refill stations near the gym and field, then stop selling single-use water bottles at games. That change would make bringing a reusable bottle the easy choice, not a test of dedication. A school event should leave memories of a close match, not a trail of containers that served for twenty minutes. The bottles are small, but the habit they teach is not.

(2) Some families will ask whether a refill station can serve a long halftime line. That concern deserves more than a slogan: keep bottled water available until stations are installed and tested, and place stations at more than one entrance. Players and spectators should not have to choose between staying hydrated and waiting through the next quarter. Think of a refill station as a public doorway: if only one door is open, a crowd forms, but opening another changes the flow. Planning for access makes the proposal stronger because it answers the people most likely to use it.

(3) The change would not make every game waste-free, and it would not erase the cost of a station. It would, however, turn a routine purchase into a routine refill. We already expect students to carry what they need for class; why should carrying a bottle to a game seem impossible? Give spectators convenient water, give teams reliable access, and give custodians fewer discarded bottles to collect. Before next season, school leaders should ask vendors for installation estimates and choose locations with students and staff. The first step is not a perfect promise. It is a practical plan that people can test.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the scene at the start of the passage help make the claim persuasive?

2. Why does the writer compare refill stations to public doorways?

3. What objection does the writer raise, and how does the response strengthen the proposal?

4. In the sentence beginning “Give spectators,” what effect does repeating “give” have on the argument?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine a school with an outdoor bike rack: write a 5- to 6-sentence argument for or against adding a roof over it. State a clear claim, show the stakes with a concrete scene, and answer a reasonable objection.

ANSWER KEY

Refill the Argument

HIGH SCHOOL · 11-12.W.1.b

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim, circle two vivid scenes or comparisons, and number an objection and its response. Use your marks to consider how these choices make the claim more persuasive. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the scene at the start of the passage help make the claim persuasive?	**The image of students holding empty bottles beside a full trash can makes the waste from games concrete and shows why a change is worth considering.**
2	Why does the writer compare refill stations to public doorways?	**The comparison helps readers picture how one station could create a line and how stations at multiple entrances could improve access.**
3	What objection does the writer raise, and how does the response strengthen the proposal?	**Families may worry about long halftime lines. The writer proposes testing stations, using more than one entrance, and keeping bottled water available until the stations are ready, making the plan more practical.**
4	In the sentence beginning "Give spectators," what effect does repeating "give" have on the argument?	**The repetition links benefits for spectators, teams, and custodians, emphasizing that the proposal could help several groups.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school should add a roof over its outdoor bike rack. On rainy mornings, students who bike leave their seats and handlebars exposed until dismissal. A shelter would make the ride home more comfortable. Some people may object that the school has more urgent expenses. Yet leaders can set a spending limit and seek prices for a simple roof, protecting funds for those needs while making biking easier. A practical improvement does not have to solve every transportation problem to be worthwhile.

Accept explanations that connect a specific choice in the passage to its persuasive effect, even if students use different terms for the strategy. For Part 3, look for a clear claim, a concrete scene, and a response that takes an objection seriously.