After Hours Evidence

Weigh sources for a library board decision

11-12.W.5.c "Assess the strengths and limitations of each source in terms of the task, purpose, and audience."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one strength and circle one limitation of each source in the passage. Number the sources 1 to 3 by how useful they are for advising the library board.

Should Cedar Street Stay Open?

(1) Our student committee must advise the library board on whether to keep the Cedar Street branch open until 9 p.m. twice a week during exam season. The board needs evidence about demand, costs, and who might be left out. A branch report counts 112 visits between 5 and 7 p.m. on four Tuesdays last April. Because staff recorded these visits at the branch, the report gives the board a concrete picture of recent use. Yet the branch closed at 7, so its counts cannot show how many people would come after 7 or why they would visit.

(2) A student council survey asks 180 high school students whether later hours would help them study; 132 say yes. Its direct question fits the proposal's purpose and lets students speak to the board. But council members shared the survey link through school clubs, so students who do not join clubs may be missing. The answers describe expected use, not actual visits, and they say little about adults who rely on the branch. The survey makes the case for student interest, but it cannot stand alone as evidence that enough residents would use the extra hours.

(3) A library director also offers a budget memo estimating $460 for staff and utilities for each two-hour extension. Written for board members deciding what they can fund, it addresses a cost that neither the visit report nor the student survey measures. However, the estimate assumes one employee can cover the desk and does not price a security guard. A proposal based only on the memo could treat access as a cost problem and miss what students need. Together, these sources support testing later hours, but the committee should ask staff about safe coverage before recommending a schedule.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the branch report help the board assess demand, and what important demand can it not measure?

2. Why does the way the student council shared its survey limit its usefulness for a decision affecting the whole community?

3. What makes the director's memo useful to the board, and what could make its cost estimate too low?

4. Which two sources together address student interest and operating costs? What question remains before the committee recommends a schedule?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine you must advise your principal about starting a free breakfast cart. In five to six sentences, assess one strength and one limitation of each source for that decision: a student poll about interest, last month's cafeteria sales log, and a food supplier's price quote. Name one additional kind of evidence the principal needs.

ANSWER KEY

After Hours Evidence

HIGH SCHOOL · 11-12.W.5.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one strength and circle one limitation of each source in the passage. Number the sources 1 to 3 by how useful they are for advising the library board. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the branch report help the board assess demand, and what important demand can it not measure?	**It records recent visits to the branch, but it cannot measure how many people would visit after the current 7 p.m. closing time.**
2	Why does the way the student council shared its survey limit its usefulness for a decision affecting the whole community?	**Sharing it through school clubs may exclude students outside clubs, and the survey says little about adults who use the branch.**
3	What makes the director's memo useful to the board, and what could make its cost estimate too low?	**It estimates the cost of an extension for the board, but it assumes one employee is enough and omits the possible cost of a security guard.**
4	Which two sources together address student interest and operating costs? What question remains before the committee recommends a schedule?	**The student survey addresses interest, and the budget memo addresses costs. The committee still needs to know whether staff can cover the later hours safely.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The student poll captures possible users' interest, which matters when the principal considers a breakfast cart. Its answers may not reflect actual use, especially if only students who already eat breakfast responded. The cafeteria sales log shows what students bought recently, but it misses students who skipped breakfast because they could not reach the cafeteria in time. The supplier's quote helps estimate food costs, although it may omit staffing and equipment. Together, the sources address demand and price but cannot show whether a cart could operate before classes. The principal should ask cafeteria staff for a staffing and setup estimate.

Accept different source rankings in Part 1 if students justify them in terms of the board's decision. For Part 3, accept other plausible limitations and missing evidence that fit the principal's task.