The Refill Rumor

Check what three messages say against the evidence they use.

6.CC.8 "Use evidence to evaluate the accuracy of information presented in multiple media messages."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each message's claim, circle the evidence offered for it, and write a number beside each claim and the evidence you think best tests it.

What Does the Counter Count?

1. At Cedar Middle School, three messages about a new water refill station appeared in one week. A Monday morning audio announcement said, "Our station saved 400 plastic bottles last week!" The speaker explained that the machine's counter had gone up by 400 since the previous Monday. The counter records each time water is dispensed. It cannot tell whether a student filled a reusable bottle, topped off a cup, or would have bought a plastic bottle instead. No one had counted plastic bottles before or after the station opened.

2. On Tuesday, a student posted, "Nobody uses the refill station." The student wrote that the hallway was empty during the ten minutes they watched it before first period. A custodian later checked the machine's counter at the start and end of Wednesday. It rose by 68. Those fills could have happened during lunch, between classes, or after school. The student's short observation describes one moment, while the counter covers a full school day. Neither source shows exactly how many different people used the station.

3. On Friday, the school newsletter said, "The station was used this week, but we do not yet know if it reduced plastic waste." It cited the machine's counter and the lack of bottle-trash records. The newsletter also asked the cleanup club to count discarded plastic bottles for several weeks. A count could show whether bottle trash changed, though other events, such as a school-wide reusable bottle giveaway, might also affect that number. The three messages reached students by audio, social media, and a school newsletter.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How well does the counter support the audio announcement's claim that 400 plastic bottles were saved? Explain.

2. How well does the student's ten-minute observation support the social media claim that nobody uses the station? Use Wednesday's evidence.

3. Why is the newsletter's statement about plastic waste more careful than the audio announcement's? Cite the missing evidence.

4. If the newsletter replaced "The station was used this week" with "68 students used it Wednesday," would the new claim be accurate? Explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a two- or three-sentence message to families that corrects a misleading impression from one of the three messages. Use evidence from two sources in the passage, and suggest one way to check a claim the sources cannot settle.

ANSWER KEY

The Refill Rumor

GRADE 6 · 6.CC.8

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each message's claim, circle the evidence offered for it, and write a number beside each claim and the evidence you think best tests it. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How well does the counter support the audio announcement's claim that 400 plastic bottles were saved? Explain.	**It supports 400 water fills, not 400 bottles saved. The counter does not show what containers people used or whether they would have bought plastic bottles.**
2	How well does the student's ten-minute observation support the social media claim that nobody uses the station? Use Wednesday's evidence.	**It does not support a claim about all use. The student watched for only ten minutes, while the counter recorded 68 fills on Wednesday.**
3	Why is the newsletter's statement about plastic waste more careful than the audio announcement's? Cite the missing evidence.	**The newsletter says the effect on plastic waste is unknown. No one counted discarded plastic bottles before or after the station opened.**
4	If the newsletter replaced "The station was used this week" with "68 students used it Wednesday," would the new claim be accurate? Explain.	**No. The counter recorded 68 fills on Wednesday, but one person could have filled a container more than once.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The student's post makes it sound as if the station is never used, but the counter recorded 68 fills on Wednesday. The school newsletter is right to say we do not yet know whether plastic waste fell. Counting discarded plastic bottles for several weeks would help us check that claim.

Accept responses that distinguish fills from bottles saved and a brief observation from all-day use. For Part 3, look for evidence from two distinct sources, a claim that stays within that evidence, and a relevant next step.