Dots and Doubts

Check the evidence behind claims about bird-safe windows

7.W.5.c "Assess the credibility and accuracy of each source."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read the passage. Underline one detail that helps you judge each source's credibility, and circle two claims whose accuracy you would check before using them.

Did the Window Dots Work?

1 At Cedar Middle School, students wanted to know whether small ClearView dots on library windows could reduce bird collisions. The science club's online report said members checked the same windows each morning for four weeks before the dots went up and four weeks afterward. They recorded 12 collisions before and 5 afterward in a dated log supervised by a teacher. The report called the drop proof that the dots caused it. Yet the log covers only one building, and the two periods had different weather.

2 A second search result was an ad from ClearView Dots, the company that made the school's window stickers. Its headline announced, "Our dots stop 100 percent of bird collisions, at any window!" Below the headline, the company offered a discount code and three customer comments saying the dots looked nice. The ad did not describe a study, name anyone who checked collision records, or say when its claim was tested. Its claim also makes a prediction about every window, not just the library windows in the club's report.

3 The city wildlife office posted a guide written by a named wildlife biologist and updated this year. It explained that birds may try to fly through glass or toward reflections of trees. The guide linked to published studies and said patterns placed across the outside of glass can reduce collisions, but no treatment guarantees zero collisions. It also warned that weather and seasonal bird movement can change counts. For the school's research project, the guide offers broader evidence, while the club's dated log offers local observations that still need careful interpretation.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Does the club's log prove that the dots caused the drop in collisions? Use one detail from the passage to explain.

2. How do the club's records test the accuracy of ClearView Dots' headline?

3. Which details make the city wildlife office's guide more credible than the ad?

4. Which source would you use for the number of collisions at the library windows, and what makes that source useful for this fact?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

For a new report about cafeteria waste, Source A is a dated student log of trash weighed on five lunch days, while Source B is a bin seller's ad claiming its bins eliminate all food waste without showing measurements. In three sentences, compare their credibility, identify a claim needing an accuracy check, and describe how you would check it.

ANSWER KEY

Dots and Doubts

GRADE 7 · 7.W.5.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read the passage. Underline one detail that helps you judge each source's credibility, and circle two claims whose accuracy you would check before using them. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Does the club's log prove that the dots caused the drop in collisions? Use one detail from the passage to explain.	**No. The weather differed between the two periods, so the log alone cannot show what caused the drop.**
2	How do the club's records test the accuracy of ClearView Dots' headline?	**The club recorded five collisions after ClearView dots went up, so the headline's claim that they stop 100 percent of collisions is false.**
3	Which details make the city wildlife office's guide more credible than the ad?	**The guide names its wildlife biologist, links to published studies, and states limits on what window treatments can do. The ad gives no study or collision records.**
4	Which source would you use for the number of collisions at the library windows, and what makes that source useful for this fact?	**Use the science club's report because its dated, teacher-supervised log records collisions at those windows.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would start with Source A because it lists dates and weights, while Source B gives no measurements and sells the bins. The ad's claim that its bins eliminate all food waste needs checking. I would weigh food waste after the bins are installed on several lunch days and compare those amounts with earlier records.

Accept other passage-based credibility details, such as the club's limited sample or the ad's sales motive. For Your Turn, the proposed check should gather evidence that can test the seller's claim.