Flooded Every Day?

Check sources before you trust a claim

8.W.5.c "Assess the credibility and accuracy of each source."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the evidence each source uses, and circle details that make you question a source's claim. Use your marks to judge which sources are credible and accurate.

The Rain Garden Claim

1. At Cedar Bend Middle School, students are investigating a claim that the rain garden beside the gym floods every day. A rain garden is a shallow planted area that collects runoff after storms. On October 15, a student posted a ten-second video of water covering the garden soil. The caption read, "This garden is flooded every day." The post showed no other dates or locations. Students saved the post to compare its claim with records collected over time.

2. The school facilities team kept a maintenance log for the same garden. According to the log, a nearby rain gauge measured 2.1 inches of rain on October 15. The team recorded standing water at 3 p.m. that day, then dry soil at 3 p.m. on October 16 and October 17. A staff member signed and dated each entry. The log was kept in the school office, where students could ask to see the original entries. It includes no weekend checks and does not say how long the water remained on October 15.

3. On October 18, a drainage company posted an article saying, "Water stays in this garden for weeks. Buy our pipes to fix it." The article linked to the student's video but did not cite the facilities log or report any site visits. That same day, the school newsletter stated that the facilities log showed standing water on October 16. The newsletter named the log as its source, but students could compare its statement with the dated entries. Neither article included new measurements from the garden.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How well does the student's video support the claim that the garden floods every day? Explain using a detail from the passage.

2. What makes the facilities log useful for checking the claim, and what is one limit of its evidence?

3. What two details should make you question the drainage company's article?

4. Is the school newsletter's statement about October 16 accurate? Check it against the log described in the passage.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a short recommendation to a classmate researching whether the garden floods every day. Choose the source you would cite, give two specific reasons for your choice, explain one limit of that source, and compare it with one other source.

ANSWER KEY

Flooded Every Day?

GRADE 8 · 8.W.5.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the evidence each source uses, and circle details that make you question a source's claim. Use your marks to judge which sources are credible and accurate. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How well does the student's video support the claim that the garden floods every day? Explain using a detail from the passage.	**The video shows water on October 15, but a ten-second clip with no other dates cannot establish that the garden floods every day.**
2	What makes the facilities log useful for checking the claim, and what is one limit of its evidence?	**It has signed, dated entries showing water on October 15 and dry soil on October 16 and 17. It has no weekend checks and only reports conditions at 3 p.m. on those dates.**
3	What two details should make you question the drainage company's article?	**The company is selling pipes, and its article offers no site visits or measurements to support its claim that water stays for weeks.**
4	Is the school newsletter's statement about October 16 accurate? Check it against the log described in the passage.	**No. The newsletter says the log showed standing water on October 16, but the log recorded dry soil at 3 p.m. that day.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would cite the facilities log because a staff member signed and dated each entry, and its checks recorded dry soil at 3 p.m. on both October 16 and 17. Those entries challenge the claim that the garden floods every day. The log has a limit: it does not show what happened on weekends or at other times of day. I would trust it more than the drainage company's article, which claims water stays for weeks without reporting any site visits or measurements.

Accept answers that distinguish what a source actually documents from a broader claim. Students may identify either missing weekend checks or the limited check times as a weakness of the log.