Paths Back Together

Comparing plans for Reconstruction after the Civil War

8.H.24 "Compare and contrast the three plans for Reconstruction and evaluate the merits of each."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one possible benefit of each plan, circle one possible drawback of each plan, and number the plans from 1 to 3 in the order they appear. Use your marks to compare what each plan might achieve.

Three Paths to Reunion

1 In 1865, the Civil War ended, but a hard question remained: How should former Confederate states rejoin the Union? President Abraham Lincoln had proposed a quick path. Under his Ten Percent Plan, a state could form a new government after 10 percent of its 1860 voters took a loyalty oath and accepted the end of slavery. This could help the nation reunite sooner. Yet such a small group could shape a state's future while many formerly enslaved people still lacked a political voice.

2 After Lincoln's assassination, President Andrew Johnson offered another route. He appointed temporary governors, pardoned many former Confederates, and required states to ratify the Thirteenth Amendment and reject Confederate debts. Like Lincoln, Johnson favored a fast return to the Union. His plan gave states room to govern themselves, which some people valued. But former Confederate leaders soon regained power, and Southern states passed Black Codes that limited the freedom of Black people. Johnson's approach offered few protections against these laws.

3 Congress took a tougher approach after clashes with Johnson. The Reconstruction Acts of 1867 placed most former Confederate states under military supervision. To rejoin, these states had to write new constitutions, allow Black men to vote, and ratify the Fourteenth Amendment, which guaranteed citizenship and equal protection under the law. This plan gave formerly enslaved people a stronger chance to influence government. However, military rule angered many white Southerners, and enforcing rights remained difficult. All three plans sought reunion, but they differed sharply over whose rights reunion would protect.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How were Lincoln's and Johnson's plans alike in their goal and pace? Give one difference in their steps for restoring states.

2. Compared with Johnson's plan, how might Congress's plan change the political power of Black people? What difficulty could Congress's plan face?

3. How did Lincoln's and Congress's plans differ in who could help shape new state governments? Give one possible benefit of each approach.

4. Order the three plans from least to most protective of Black people's rights. Explain your order with a detail about each plan.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine you advise lawmakers in 1867. In 70 to 100 words, propose a plan that combines one feature from each of two historical plans and fixes a weakness in the third. Explain one benefit and one possible cost of your plan.

ANSWER KEY

Paths Back Together

GRADE 8 · 8.H.24

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one possible benefit of each plan, circle one possible drawback of each plan, and number the plans from 1 to 3 in the order they appear. Use your marks to compare what each plan might achieve. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How were Lincoln's and Johnson's plans alike in their goal and pace? Give one difference in their steps for restoring states.	**Both sought a fast return to the Union. Lincoln called for a loyalty oath from 10 percent of a state's 1860 voters, while Johnson appointed temporary governors and required states to ratify the Thirteenth Amendment and reject Confederate debts.**
2	Compared with Johnson's plan, how might Congress's plan change the political power of Black people? What difficulty could Congress's plan face?	**Congress required states to allow Black men to vote and ratify the Fourteenth Amendment. Johnson's plan offered few protections against Black Codes. Congress's plan could face resistance to military rule, and enforcing rights would be difficult.**
3	How did Lincoln's and Congress's plans differ in who could help shape new state governments? Give one possible benefit of each approach.	**Lincoln allowed a small group of 1860 voters to form a government, which could speed reunion. Congress required states to allow Black men to vote, giving formerly enslaved people a stronger political voice.**
4	Order the three plans from least to most protective of Black people's rights. Explain your order with a detail about each plan.	**One supported order is Johnson, Lincoln, Congress. Johnson's plan offered few protections against Black Codes. Lincoln's plan accepted the end of slavery but left many formerly enslaved people without a political voice. Congress required Black male voting and ratification of the Fourteenth Amendment.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would let a state begin forming a new government once 10 percent of its 1860 voters take a loyalty oath, as Lincoln proposed. Before that government can rejoin the Union, Black men must be allowed to vote, as Congress required. Federal officials should block Black Codes, a weakness of Johnson's approach. This plan could reunite states without shutting Black citizens out of elections. Checking state laws and protecting voters would take time and could face fierce resistance.

Accept other supported rankings in question 4 if students explain how they weighed the plans' protections and effects. For the proposal, accept different combinations that accurately use features of two plans, address a weakness in the third, and explain a plausible benefit and cost.