Security at a Cost

Weigh competing goals in a port policy decision

GE.1.5 "Critique the trade-off among economic growth, national security, efficiency, and personal freedom."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one benefit and one cost of each plan, then write G, S, E, or F beside each to show whether it affects economic growth, national security, efficiency, or personal freedom.

Two Plans for the Port

1. At the Port of Haven, trucks carry imported parts to factories across the country. Officials worry that a dangerous shipment could enter through the port, so they propose two security plans. Under Plan A, every truck passes through a cargo scanner, each driver verifies a fingerprint, and the port keeps entry records for one year. Under Plan B, officers check photo IDs, inspect a random selection of trucks, and delete entry records after seven days. Neither plan can stop every threat. The city council must decide how much protection is worth the cost and the limits placed on drivers.

2. Plan A could catch more dangerous cargo and make it harder for someone to enter using another person's ID. That could strengthen national security. Yet scanning every truck may create long lines, especially when equipment needs repair. Factories might receive parts late, and businesses could pay for extra storage or shipping. Those costs may discourage expansion and slow economic growth. A slower port is also less efficient: it moves fewer trucks with the same staff and space. Fingerprint collection and yearlong records raise privacy concerns for drivers, even when they have broken no law.

3. Plan B lets most trucks move quickly and collects less personal information. Faster deliveries could help firms meet orders and invest in new jobs. Drivers would face less tracking, giving them more control over their personal information. But random inspections can miss a dangerous shipment, and a photo ID may be easier to misuse than a fingerprint check. Council members could also modify either plan, such as shortening Plan A's record period or adding targeted checks to Plan B. A sound choice weighs how much security each step might add against its effects on growth, efficiency, and freedom.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. A council member favors Plan A for national security. What benefit supports that view, and what two costs should the member weigh against it?

2. A shipper favors Plan B because trucks move faster. How might that speed help economic growth, and what national security risk comes with the plan?

3. Would shortening Plan A's record period address all of its costs? Explain using two details from the passage.

4. Which plan would you recommend to a council that values both economic growth and national security? Support your choice with one benefit and one risk from the passage.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine a rail freight terminal that moves goods across the country. Propose a security policy different from Plans A and B, then critique its likely effects on national security, economic growth, efficiency, and personal freedom. Include one change that could improve the balance.

Security at a Cost

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one benefit and one cost of each plan, then write G, S, E, or F beside each to show whether it affects economic growth, national security, efficiency, or personal freedom. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	A council member favors Plan A for national security. What benefit supports that view, and what two costs should the member weigh against it?	**Scanning every truck could catch more dangerous cargo. Long lines could reduce efficiency and slow business growth, while fingerprint collection and yearlong records could limit drivers' privacy.**
2	A shipper favors Plan B because trucks move faster. How might that speed help economic growth, and what national security risk comes with the plan?	**Faster deliveries could help firms meet orders and invest in jobs. Random inspections might miss a dangerous shipment.**
3	Would shortening Plan A's record period address all of its costs? Explain using two details from the passage.	**No. Shorter record keeping could reduce a privacy concern, but scanning every truck could still create long lines and delay parts.**
4	Which plan would you recommend to a council that values both economic growth and national security? Support your choice with one benefit and one risk from the passage.	**Either plan is acceptable with evidence. For example, Plan B could support growth through faster deliveries, but its random inspections could miss a dangerous shipment.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

At a rail terminal, I would scan cars selected because of missing paperwork, check every worker's photo ID, and keep entry logs for one week. Focused scanning might catch threats to national security without slowing every train. Faster deliveries could support business growth and efficient use of equipment. However, logs could reveal workers' movements, limiting privacy. I would delete logs after one day to protect freedom, although that could make later investigations harder.

Accept different recommendations when students accurately weigh passage-based benefits and costs. For the open task, look for a distinct policy and a plausible effect on each of the four goals.