The Last Ride

Weigh the benefits and costs of two transit proposals.

S.9.5 "Evaluate possible solutions to social problems and the potential consequences."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one likely benefit and circle one likely drawback of each option. Number the two details that would matter most to your decision.

Getting Home After the Late Shift

1 At 11:30 p.m., a nurse's aide finishes a shift at a hospital on the edge of Riverton. The last bus on her route left an hour earlier. A ride home costs nearly as much as an hour of work, so she sometimes walks two miles to a stop served by a different route. Many late-shift workers face the same problem. At a public meeting, residents ask the city to improve access to jobs without making fares unaffordable. The transportation office considers two options: extend one bus route past midnight or offer discounted rides through a private car service.

2 Extending the bus route would give workers a predictable ride at a low fare. It could also help people who do not have smartphones or bank cards, which some car services require. Yet a late bus might carry few riders on certain nights. Drivers would need to be paid even when seats are empty, and the city might have to reduce service at another time to cover the cost. The route would serve workers near its stops, but workers living far from those stops could still face a long walk home.

3 Discounted car rides could take workers closer to their doors and adjust to changing shift schedules. The city would pay only when someone booked a ride, but the cost per trip could be higher than a bus fare. A limited number of vouchers might run out before the end of each month. Officials could reserve vouchers for workers far from bus stops, then count how many people use each option during a three-month trial. They would also need to ask who cannot book a car and check whether workers can actually reach their homes safely.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. If the city puts access for workers without smartphones first, which option is stronger? Explain one drawback the city must still consider.

2. If many workers live far from bus stops, which option better meets their needs? What could limit that option?

3. If the city cannot add transportation funds, what trade-off could extending the bus route create? Who might be affected?

4. Would reserving car-ride vouchers for workers far from bus stops remove every access problem? Use two details from the passage to support your judgment.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a social problem other than transportation. In 70 to 100 words, compare two possible solutions, give one benefit and one possible drawback of each, then recommend one based on who would have fair access.

The Last Ride

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one likely benefit and circle one likely drawback of each option. Number the two details that would matter most to your decision. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	If the city puts access for workers without smartphones first, which option is stronger? Explain one drawback the city must still consider.	**The late bus is stronger because riders would not need a smartphone. It could cost the city money even on nights with few riders.**
2	If many workers live far from bus stops, which option better meets their needs? What could limit that option?	**Discounted car rides could take workers closer to home, but vouchers might run out or some workers might be unable to book a car.**
3	If the city cannot add transportation funds, what trade-off could extending the bus route create? Who might be affected?	**The city might reduce service at another time to pay late-bus drivers, affecting people who rely on that service.**
4	Would reserving car-ride vouchers for workers far from bus stops remove every access problem? Use two details from the passage to support your judgment.	**No. Vouchers might run out, and some workers might be unable to book a car because they lack a smartphone or bank card.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Many students in my town cannot get reliable internet at home. The school could lend portable hotspots. Students could work after school, but weak cell signals might leave some unable to connect. The town could keep the library open later, giving students computers and staff support, but students without a safe way home might be left out. I recommend hotspot loans, with devices reserved for students who lack home access. This puts limited resources where they are most needed, though the school would still need a plan for students with weak signals.

Accept other supported trade-offs in Questions 1 to 3. For Part 3, look for two distinct solutions, a benefit and drawback for each, and a recommendation that considers unequal access.