Rescue or Reform?

Weighing the results of two New Deal phases

USH.4.4 "Analyze the strengths and weaknesses of the first and second New Deal, as well as the short- and long-term impacts."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one strength and circle one weakness of each New Deal phase. Then write S beside a short-term impact and L beside a long-term impact.

What Did the New Deal Change?

1 In 1933, a shuttered bank could turn a family's savings into a question mark. President Franklin D. Roosevelt's first New Deal, launched in 1933, aimed to stop the panic and get people working. A bank holiday let officials inspect banks before they reopened, and federal deposit insurance later made many savers more willing to trust banks. The Civilian Conservation Corps (CCC) hired young men for conservation work, bringing wages into struggling households. Yet these measures did not create enough jobs for everyone. Some CCC camps were segregated, and the program offered far fewer opportunities to women.

2 By 1935, emergency rescue was not enough for families still living with unemployment. The second New Deal expanded the federal government's role. The Works Progress Administration (WPA) paid people to build roads, schools, and other public projects. The Social Security Act created old-age benefits and unemployment insurance, while the Wagner Act protected collective bargaining by workers' unions. These laws offered paychecks then and a safety net for later. But early Social Security coverage left out many farm and domestic workers, occupations held by large numbers of Black Americans. Even with new jobs, unemployment remained high.

3 The two phases tackled different problems, and their results differed. Bank protections from the first New Deal helped restore confidence quickly, while Social Security from the second became a lasting part of American life. Neither phase ended the Depression: a sharp downturn in 1937 and 1938 showed how fragile recovery remained. World War II production, not New Deal programs alone, finally brought unemployment down dramatically. Critics also argued that expanding federal power cost too much, while others said the programs did too little for excluded workers. The New Deal's legacy is therefore both greater economic security and unfinished promises.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How did two first New Deal measures address different immediate problems, and what important problem remained?

2. How did the second New Deal offer both immediate aid and longer-term protection?

3. Compare one weakness of the first New Deal with one weakness of the second. Who faced each limit?

4. Why would it be inaccurate to say the New Deal ended the Depression, even though it produced lasting changes?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a short editorial paragraph arguing whether the first or second New Deal left the more valuable legacy. Compare a strength of each phase, discuss a weakness of the phase you chose, and explain one short-term and one long-term impact using details from the passage.

Rescue or Reform?

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one strength and circle one weakness of each New Deal phase. Then write S beside a short-term impact and L beside a long-term impact. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How did two first New Deal measures address different immediate problems, and what important problem remained?	**Bank inspections and deposit insurance helped restore trust in banks. The CCC provided jobs, but the first New Deal did not create enough jobs for everyone.**
2	How did the second New Deal offer both immediate aid and longer-term protection?	**The WPA paid people to work on public projects. Social Security created old-age benefits and unemployment insurance for longer-term protection.**
3	Compare one weakness of the first New Deal with one weakness of the second. Who faced each limit?	**The CCC offered far fewer opportunities to women, and some camps were segregated. Early Social Security coverage excluded many farm and domestic workers, including many Black Americans.**
4	Why would it be inaccurate to say the New Deal ended the Depression, even though it produced lasting changes?	**A downturn in 1937 and 1938 showed that recovery was fragile, and World War II production brought unemployment down dramatically. Protections such as Social Security lasted.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The second New Deal left the more valuable legacy because its protections lasted beyond the emergency. The first New Deal restored trust in banks through inspections and deposit insurance, an important short-term gain for families afraid of losing savings. The second New Deal's WPA provided immediate wages, while Social Security established old-age benefits and unemployment insurance that became a lasting safety net. Still, that phase failed many farm and domestic workers, who were excluded from early Social Security coverage. Its legacy matters more to me because it changed how the government protects people when work ends.

Accept either phase as the stronger legacy if the student supports the judgment with accurate passage details. Short-term impacts include restored bank confidence or WPA wages; long-term impacts include Social Security protections.